

President Craig Stahl called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. and opened with the **Invocation**, given by Brett Fuqua, followed by the **Pledge of Allegiance**.

The Clerk called the **roll** and the following Commissioners responded: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7.

Craig Stahl announced the **winners of the 2009 Pride Results In Desirable Environments (P.R.I.D.E.) Awards** which were organized and selected by the members of the Neighborhood Advisory Committee. He said nominations were sought through the local news media, The Meigs Street Messenger and the city's website. Craig Stahl then asked the winners to come forward as their names were announced to accept their award (plaque) and a gift certificate for dinner for two as donated by Sortino's Little Italy, Damon's, Port Sandusky Restaurant, Berardi's, Kaman's Corner, Damon's Restaurant, Zinc Brasserie, Toft Dairy, Thirsty Pony, Lunch Box, Joe Wok and the East Side Café. He also thanked Kroger's and Joe Sundae for their in-kind donations of cake and coffee, respectively.

The winners were then announced and given their awards: Sandra Irby, 1423 West Larchmont Street, Bryan & Wendy Lippus, 1201 Waverly Road, Ron & Julie Brooks, 1206 Columbus Avenue, James & Debra Kurtz, 820 West Osborne Street, Thomas Cromer, Jr., 1412 Buchanan Street, Mr. & Mrs. Vincent Santi, 2713 14th Street, Frank & Karen Baker, 305 42nd Street and David Koch for Koch Funeral Home, 520 Columbus Avenue. Other winners were acknowledged who could not be present including: Gary Neill & James Miller, 231 East Washington Street, Richard & Michael Keller, 1429 Columbus Avenue and Walter & Louise Cunningham, 1806 Pierce Street.

On motion of Julie Farrar and second of Pervis Brown, the Commissioners approved the minutes of the September 14, 2009 meeting and dispensed with the oral reading of the minutes. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed.

Sue Daugherty made a presentation on behalf of Serving Our Seniors (SOS) and offered a recap of their Annual Report. SOS provides geriatric social services for Erie County residents in an effort to allow them to maintain their independence. They offer services at a price which their clients can afford and are considered a service of last resort, meaning they attempt to make referrals for existing services rather than duplicating services. SOS operates under a Board of Directors and is a private, not-for-profit organization funded exclusively through a tax levy. The SOS budget shows 84% of the monies available were used for direct services and 16% for administrative costs. In FY 2008, employees of SOS received 10,248 calls for problem resolution and made referrals accordingly; of these calls, 5,588 were from Sandusky residents. The Senior Advocate Program is designed to help clients with needs that jeopardize their independence, the majority of which are financial issues. Sixty percent of those provided assistance through this program, or 34 clients, were from Sandusky. The most renowned program offered by SOS is the Affordable Medications Program which assists under or uninsured seniors with financial assistance for necessary medications, the largest of which are liquid meds and meds for vision impairment. During FY 2008, a total of 36 Sandusky residents were provided assistance via this program. The Drug Repository provides medications donated by institutional pharmacies and dispensed through the local Buderer Drug Store. Sue Daugherty stated Sandusky is the second community in Ohio to provide this type of program and has been able to tremendously reduce the amount of medical waste previously generated. She did not have specific statistics for Sandusky, but said the large majority of the patient base for the Drug Repository was from Sandusky. In a one-month period, 88 elderly use approximately \$24,000 (retail value) of medications in this program.

Sue Daugherty then spoke about the Emergency Home Repair Program which provides furnaces and hot water tanks for qualifying seniors; during FY 2008, five older adults in Sandusky were provided assistance through this program. The Elder Gazette is a newsletter published every other month and is free of charge and made available to Erie County residents aged 60+. This publication costs \$.64 to produce. The Masters Challenge helps older adults to stay physically fit and active and during FY 2008, 52 persons registered for programs and 117 actually participated. The Minor Home Repair program is available for repairs which do not exceed \$300 to complete and 78 residents were assisted through this program during FY 2008. The average cost of repairs was \$135.64 and the overall cost for the program was \$16,819.61. The Hot Meals Program has been in existence for over 28 years and SOS contracts with the Erie County Senior Center to package and deliver these meals. Social isolation is an issue for those living in more rural areas of the community and this program also helps facilitate face-to-face interaction for these persons. The average cost for a meal is \$6.63 and anonymous donations cover some of the cost.

Sue Daugherty spoke of the Personal Care & Housekeeping Program to assist persons with their personal hygiene and general housekeeping. These programs are offered on a payment program whereby the senior pays what they can afford and SOS funds the balance. 4,218 hours of assistance were provided during FY 2008 which included approximately 60 recipients. The Ramp Program provides temporary metal ramps to assist clients safely enter and exit their home and currently, 51 are in circulation in Erie County. The Ray Koch Fund was founded by SOS and provides assistance for utilities, homelessness, food and transportation to the hospital for urgent needs. This fund was used to provide assistance for 26 Sandusky residents during FY 2008. SOS contracts with the Erie County Board of MRDD for transportation services and the cost is \$1.50/one-way trip and \$2 for a rural trip. Transportation passes are provided to those who cannot afford this cost. Weekend transportation is no longer offered. The Lawn mowing, Senior Recreation, One-day Trip Scholarship and Dental Programs were also made available for Erie County senior citizens during FY 2008. Craig Stahl then asked if the Commissioners had any questions for Sue Daugherty.

Dan Kaman thanked Sue Daugherty for her work and said SOS provides a huge safety net for our residents. He stated Sue Daugherty has been in charge of SOS for many years and does a great job. He has heard nothing but good about the organization and knows the City Commission will do what they can to help. Craig Stahl said he made a call to SOS last week and talked with Nancy about his neighbors. He said Nancy was very helpful and made a referral to the VA which, previously, he was unaware of. This helped to cut through some red tape and save money for the client and it meant a lot for them to be able to stay in their home. Sue Daugherty stated it is sometimes difficult to navigate through the processes and this is how the staff at SOS tries to assist. Julie Farrar thanked Sue Daugherty and said she knew SOS did a lot of things, but was not aware, until tonight, of all they do for the elderly in our community. She has some ideas for persons who may be interested in providing transportation and will put them in touch with Sue Daugherty. Pervis Brown said it was important for the public to know SOS is not funded by grants; rather it is funded by the community. He said SOS has a lot of accountability, helps many of his neighbors and feels they are doing a fine job.

Stuart Wells of Future Green and Centurion Technologies, LLC gave a presentation for potential energy savings for the City of Sandusky on its utility costs. Centurion is an Ohio company with ten years of energy conservation experience for lighting and energy management. Stuart Wells talked about the utility rates for Sandusky based upon deregulation in Ohio in 1999. There was a rate freeze from 2000 – 2005 and a rate stabilization period which ended December 31, 2008. FirstEnergy has already shifted to rate auctions on the open market this year while rates in NY have risen 16% since 2002; rates in the still-regulated West Virginia are about flat with no increase in rates. The Federal government will be imposing an approximate 20% tax on utilities and carbon reduction legislation will impact electric costs by another 20%. Historically, Stuart Wells said Ohio has been 7.5 cents to 8.5 cents per kilowatt hour with the city expected to pay approximately \$1.1 million for electricity in 2009. By the year 2018, this cost is expected to rise to \$1.8 million. Municipalities are being forced to cut their costs without affecting services and Future Green is proposing to bring the city a comprehensive plan showing how to curtail the rising costs of energy. Stuart Wells stated 44% of a commercial building's electricity is used for lighting. Current technology can offer reductions in energy costs and for every one percent of reductions, the city will save more than \$100,000 over the next ten years.

Stuart Wells stated his company is proposing a citywide investigation to determine the amount of energy savings available to the city. His company will also offer an educational program for the community to show the steps the city is taking and to teach others how to do the same thing. The city can benefit by addressing consumption and demand at each city property and learning how to control utility costs while protecting the city from rate hikes; his company will provide a process to reach these goals. The community forums will help educate the public about energy efficiency and alternative energy. Stuart stated the city has already been working with his company to upgrade the lighting downtown which should provide \$60,000 in savings over the next two years. Over the next five years, it is anticipated a savings of \$1.2 million can be realized without affecting the city's debt. The implementation of the recommendations provided through the study is also included as part of the investigation.

Craig Stahl asked if the Commissioners had any questions. Pervis Brown asked if half of the lights downtown could be turned off at a certain time of day to help reduce our electric costs. Stuart Wells said this would be a creative option to save money and would be a decision for the city to make. Pervis Brown asked what the \$360,000 in potential savings was based upon. Craig Kutschbach, also from Centurion Technologies, responded by saying his company has ten years of experience in providing energy upgrades and the average savings per building is based upon the building's historical

experiences. Craig Stahl asked if this study would parallel with the Honeywell contract. Matt Kline said he has addressed this question with Stuart Wells as the Honeywell project was done with a 10-year payback/term. He said this or other future audits would need to be performed respecting the contract with Honeywell. Craig Stahl said he understands the cost for the study would be \$60,000 and the optional community forums would cost \$20,000. Dan Kaman said he did not believe the Honeywell results were promising nor did they save us much money. He said we are only in year two and he is all for going green, but does not feel the city has seen this payoff yet. Craig Stahl asked the Law Department to look into this matter first to ensure Honeywell could not take legal action against the city. Craig Kutschbach said there have been significant changes in technology and all proposed expenditures will be justified in the term of their agreement with a payback or recoup of the monies expended for the study. Craig Stahl stated the city should do its research first and answer the legal questions posed before considering a recommendation to proceed.

Sue Daugherty then asked - from the audience - what other communities have had energy audits performed by Centurion. Craig Kutschbach said they have previously worked with manufacturing companies and Sandusky would be the first municipality for them. Craig Stahl then indicated Future Green and Centurion officials should continue to work with Matt Kline and return with a proposal that would ensure the city's investment with Honeywell.

Matt Kline said he asked Stuart Wells to be here today to put the issue out for consideration and he was not asking for a decision, only feedback. Dave Waddington said he was involved in the Honeywell project and he is aware how technology has changed. There is a difference in cost savings from when this began to now. He knows Future Green has been involved with the upgrades to the lights downtown, but he said an energy study was never done for the city building that he is aware of. He would like to see what Honeywell suggests and look at a ten-year forecast. He would like to make sure all aspects are worked out so we can figure our projected savings. Dave Waddington also stated he likes the idea of hosting community forums as the residents are the ones footing the bill and he believes it is smart to show them what this can do for the city.

Under **Audience Participation**, the following offered their comments on Agenda items:

Dennis Timple, 553 Bimini Drive, commented on Item #3. He said the monies donated by Cedar Point from their change fund and Admissions Tax receipts are paid for by their visitors. The proposed increase in Income Tax is one quarter of a percent which is a 25% increase; Cedar Point is saying they will accept a 25% increase in Admission Tax going from 3% – 3.25%; this is actually 1/3 of what the Commission is asking city residents to pay.

Tim Schwanger, 362 Sheffield, said he did not believe the proposed increase in Admissions Tax mirrors the proposed increase in Income Tax. The proposed Income Tax increase is expected to generate an additional \$1.5 million while the proposed Admissions Tax increase is expected to generate an additional \$300,000 which he considers a token increase. This would amount to \$100 more per resident each year and \$.10 more per tourist. He stated the Commissioners should do the right thing and increase the Admissions Tax one percent each year for the next three years.

John Ginty, 5055 Providence Drive, agrees with the comments made about Item #3. He said in addition to passing a Resolution praising Cedar Point, the city should pass a Resolution praising the Firefighters and other city employees who agreed to take less money. John Ginty also asked about Item #5 and if there would be additional transit services provided for residents in the far West end of the city as they are left out.

Sue Daugherty, 1016 Third Street, asked if anyone could explain the goal of the Honeywell project and if the city did or did not realize a savings in their utility costs. Ed Widman explained the Honeywell contract is for a ten-year period and we are not to pay any more than the cost of making improvements less the savings from the utilities. Honeywell has been collecting this information from the city and we are supposed to at the very least break even as the city did not expend any money up front; rather, Honeywell and Johnson Controls 'payment' is realized through savings in our utility costs. Ed Widman also stated in the year-to-date comparisons for gas and electric, costs were higher in 2009, but there have been rate increases and possibly increases in our usage. He has not performed an analysis for our total usage yet. Honeywell is looking at this information and will be coming back to talk to the City Commissioners about how this whole process will work. Sue asked the Commissioners to see what other communities are doing in this regard as the City of Cleveland has a jump start on these kinds of things. She also stated \$20,000 seemed like a lot of money to run a community forum and for a \$5,000

donation to Serving Our Seniors, she would offer an educational community forum for this purpose. Brett Fuqua said he understands the cost of \$60,000 for the study but felt \$20,000 for community forums is quite extensive and would not fiscally responsible for the city to fund.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said she thought these two companies were duplicating each other and asked when the Honeywell contract is up. Don Icsman said it was a ten-year contract and will expire in 2017. He too worries about duplication and stated the contract provides a guaranteed savings for the city from Honeywell and we cannot "replace" them.

On motion of Pervis Brown and second of Brett Fuqua, the Commissioners moved to accept all communications. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed.

ITEM #1 – Communication – Submitted by Edward Widman, Finance Director

BUDGETARY INFORMATION: Amendments are required to adjust the budget for previous actions of the City. The City Commission has approved several contracts that are being added to the budget at this time. These items include grants (Landbank, Trailer Park & HUD), Court Accounts, Hayes Ave., Mills St., and utility improvement projects (Chemical, Intake, Buchanan/Hayes, Cedar Point & WPC, Phase 2).

ORDINANCE NO. 09-078: It is requested an Ordinance be passed adopting Amendment No. 1 to Ordinance No. 09-012 passed by this City Commission on March 9, 2009, making General Appropriations for the Fiscal Year 2009 and declaring that this Ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Bob Warner, the Commission authorized the passage of this Ordinance under suspension of the rules in full accordance of Section 14 of the City Charter. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed. Roll Call on the Ordinance: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the Ordinance passed.

ITEM #2

ORDINANCE NO. 09-079: It is requested an Ordinance be passed amending Part One (Administrative Code), Title Five (Officers and Departments), Chapter 145 (Employment Provisions) of the Codified Ordinances, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this Ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Brett Fuqua and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission authorized the passage of this Ordinance under suspension of the rules in full accordance of Section 14 of the City Charter. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed. Roll Call on the Ordinance: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the Ordinance passed.

ITEM #3 – This item was ordered in at the September 14, 2009 City Commission meeting

RESOLUTION NO. 027-09R: It is requested a Resolution be passed acknowledging the importance of Cedar Point and recognizing the vital contributions it makes to the City and its residents and memorializing this City Commission's intention regarding the City's Admissions Tax contained in Chapter 195 of the Codified Ordinances; and declaring that this Resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Bob Warner and second of Pervis Brown, the Commission authorized the passage of this Resolution under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Bob Warner stated he recalls a proposal to increase the Income Tax by one quarter of a percent and a proposed increase in the Admissions Tax by the same percentage or one quarter of a percent. He said it has never been implied to raise either tax by more than this percentage. Craig Stahl said the base rates are different for each tax which makes the amounts which would be generated different, but one quarter of a percent is one quarter of a percent. Dan Kaman said he is against raising taxes but he will vote yes on this Resolution. He thanked Cedar Point for talking to the city and being a business partner with us. He said they do so many things for us and thanked them for their

consideration as they could have fought us like they did with the Parking Tax issue and generated bad press for both of us. Julie Farrar said this is the third time since she has been a City Commissioner that she has proposed increasing the Admissions Tax, but it is only the first time to come to the table for a vote. She said she is happy that it is at least one quarter of a percent and personally feels the city should raise Admissions Tax regardless of the outcome of the Income Tax levy.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed. Roll Call on the Resolution: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the Resolution passed.

ITEM #4 – Communication – Submitted by Kathryn K. McKillips, P.E., Engineer

BUDGETARY INFORMATION: The revised project cost based on bids, including engineering, inspection, advertising and miscellaneous costs are \$54,045.00. This project will be paid with Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds.

ORDINANCE NO. 09-080: It is requested an Ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a contract with Ed Burdue & Company of Sandusky, Ohio, for the demolition of 727 Meigs Street, 1217 Ransom Street, 1802 Putnam Street, 228 Cable Street, 617 and 619 Taylor Street and 617 E. Market Street (house only), Sandusky, Ohio; and declaring that this Ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Bob Warner and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission authorized the passage of this Ordinance under suspension of the rules in full accordance of Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Dan Kaman asked the status of auctioning items within these homes prior to demolition. Carrie Handy said we have not done this, but Habitat for Humanity did go through the house on East Market Street before the city took possession. She stated we need to be careful once a contract is awarded for demolition as the items within the home are included as part of the bid and the bids are lower because of this. Dan Kaman said he thought we should contact other agencies and let them go in to remove reusable items before we award the contract and bigger cities are doing this rather than sending all materials to the landfill. Carrie Handy said we could consider doing this more but the city should be cognizant of the fact the houses, once condemned, may not have much left for salvage. Julie Farrar said she thought we could try this with the next batch of homes and weigh the costs afterward to see if it makes a difference. Pervis Brown stated we need to be careful about letting others go into condemned houses because of safety issues. He said the average citizen and a do-it-yourself guy could cause a liability for the city and 90% of condemned houses do not have items worthwhile for salvage. Craig Stahl said he would like to talk to Carrie Handy tomorrow regarding the long list of homes for consideration with the Housing Appeals Board.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. Roll Call on the Ordinance: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the Ordinance passed.

ITEM #5 – Communication – Submitted by Carrie R. Handy, Chief Planner/Transit Administrator

BUDGETARY INFORMATION: This grant has a significant impact on the transit system's budget, as it offsets the losses in farebox revenue from offering reduced fares to persons with disabilities and persons over age 65. It is also used as a local match for our Federal Transit Administration grant funding.

RESOLUTION NO. 028-09R: It is requested a Resolution be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to accept a grant in the amount of \$53,640 from the Ohio Department of Transportation for CY 2010 Elderly and Disabled Transit Fare Assistance Program; and declaring that this Resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Brett Fuqua and second of Julie Farrar, the Commission authorized the passage of this Resolution under suspension of the rules in full accordance of Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Bob Warner asked about transit services for the elderly residents living in the far west side. Carrie Handy said if the city would receive these grant monies, the fares would be offset by offering half price for seniors. The SPARC route is a separate operation and they are looking at adding a stop at the Westgate Center for this route. Julie Farrar explained the difference between SPARC and STS; SPARC is a

specific route with preset stops whereby the Transit is a "call ahead" system for any location in the city where rides are pre-scheduled.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. Roll Call on the Resolution: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the Resolution passed.

Matt Kline then gave his **City Manager's Report**. He asked for acceptance of a **donation in the amount of \$434 from the Friends of the Greenhouse** which was money the committee members raised through fundraising efforts. **On motion of Pervis Brown and second of Craig Stahl, the Commissioners approved acceptance of this donation.** Matt Kline stated this money will be used for the purchase of a printer/facsimile/copy machine for use by the Friends of the Greenhouse.

Matt Kline asked for the **acceptance of a donation in the amount of \$1,537 from Dave Freyberg for the purchase of a memorial park bench. Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Dan Kaman, the Commissioners approved the acceptance of this donation.**

Matt Kline stated the **Erie County Firefighters Association will host a Silent Alarm Parade** on October 4 beginning at 6 p.m. at the Erie County Firefighters Memorial in Washington Park.

Matt Kline provided a recap of the **ESPN Bassmasters Northern Fishing Series** as prepared by Michele Hall, Recreation Program Supervisor. Fishing days were scheduled for Thursday, Friday and Saturday but fishing was canceled on Friday due to unfavorable lake conditions. Thursday and Saturday provided great fishing for small and large mouth bass. There were 208 competitors, 104 professional and 104 amateur fishermen. Fisherman were welcomed from the states of Ohio, Michigan, Florida, South Dakota, Tennessee, Texas, Pennsylvania, New York, Minnesota and New Jersey. Jonathon VanDam, 21, took home the top prize winning the Bassmaster Northern Open on Lake Erie, his first national tournament victory. Jonathon caught a 24-pound, 8-ounce limit of five bass to win the tournament. Combined with his 20-6 catch Thursday, he captured the \$45,000 top prize. Jonathon's father, Randy, caught Ohio's state record 9.5 pound smallmouth bass on June 16, 1993, in Lake Erie, a mark that has never been challenged. First-day leader Pete Gluszek of Mount Laurel, N.J., finished second with 42 pounds, followed by Frank Scalish (41-0) and Dick Parker (40-4) of Amherst. Anyone can log onto Bassmasters.com for final results and pictures of this weekend's events or visit Sandusky Recreation's Facebook page. Matt Kline said he greeted the fisherman on Thursday and there was a lot of energy. He said ESPN had many staff members working the event while the city had two staff members. He thanked the people who came to see the weigh-ins and the Quality Inn & Suites for their support. He also appreciated the local news coverage, ESPN and the Cleveland Plain Dealer for their coverage.

Matt Kline said he wished to give a brief update regarding our **Moody's rating** which is A2 with \$27 million of general obligation debt. A complete report is available in the Finance Department and Moody's has stated the current financial pressures the city is facing are being addressed by our commitment to maintain our General Fund reserves and the **proposed increased in Admissions Tax and Income Tax**. If either tax is rejected, Matt Kline would expect the implementation of further personnel reductions to restore structural balance. He said Moody's will continue to closely monitor the city and failure of either tax could cause our financial profile to no longer be commensurate with an A2 rating. If the Income Tax does not pass, we will face a \$1.5 million deficit in our 2010 budget. Ed Widman said the percentages for the General Fund have been broken out with 74% of General Fund revenues earmarked for safety services, 19½% for other service areas and 7% for administrative. Ed Widman said the proposed Income Tax increase will generate about \$1.1 million for the safety forces, just under \$300,000 for other service areas and about \$100,000 for administrative. Bob Warner asked if the information shared by Matt Kline and Ed Widman this evening could be made available for the general public and Matt Kline indicated they were working on putting this information together which shows each city department and what share of the monies each will receive if the levy is passed so there is no confusion about this.

Julie Farrar stated she has heard rumors that if the Income Tax levy passes, the SFD will not see a dime of the money and she said this is simply not true; rather, the SFD would get 74% of the money generated. She said she has never voted no on a mental health, senior or school levy and it is our responsibility as a community to take care of our seniors and our kids. She said the city has survived for 41 years on a 1% Income Tax, but in 2008, we had 4,878 calls for service and there were 2,798 in 1975.

She said the majority of our population is elderly, the cost to provide services has gone up and she hopes the community will support the increase.

Bob Warner asked if the city could support the tax issue monetarily. Don Icsman indicated the city could do this and in the past the Commissioners have approved staff time (which equates to money) for development projects. He said this should be considered as a furtherance of governance to support the tax increase as it is "our own" and it will help the city to do its business. Don Icsman said the Commission can approve what it deems appropriate and time spent in the past for development projects by Don Miers and Scott Schell would be a similar comparison (no monetary outlay, but staff time).

Bob Warner then made a motion which was seconded by Pervis Brown to donate \$3,000 to the Committee for a Stronger Sandusky to help offset some of their costs to get information out to the people.

Discussion: Dan Kaman stated he voted no on approval to place the Income Tax increase on the ballot and he will vote no on this motion. He stated when he disagreed with the past City Manager he was perceived as a negative person, but he considers himself a realistic person. Dan Kaman said if the Income Tax levy passes, he thinks that would be great but realizes most of the places people who live in Sandusky work are outside of the city, layoffs are hitting practically every week, employees are being cut from 40 to 32 hour workweeks, employees are paying more for their benefits and it is not just the senior population who is hurting. He questions how this will affect the working people and was for a sunset date for the tax increase. Dan Kaman said the city should not be promoting this issue, the City Commission placed it on the ballot and it is now up to the people to decide.

Brett Fuqua said he supports the Income Tax increase and hopes it passes as we need it, but he does not think the city should be spending \$3,000 for a Political Action Committee (PAC). He said it is not a good time for the city although this is a small amount of money. Bob Warner said he has heard a lot of negativity about a tax increase and not everyone will learn from TV (watching City Commission meetings) the truth about why we need these monies; rather people will learn about this in the newspaper. He is concerned about how this will go and believes informing the citizens through mailings can help put information out there about where the money will go. Dave Waddington said he will also be voting no and is listening to his constituents, some whom are out of work and some whose hours have been cut. He said there is a crisis in Sandusky and hopes it turns around. He said the majority of the people in Sandusky know this information and we will know by November 3 what they think; he cannot talk about cutbacks and then spend \$3,000 to put this information out. Craig Stahl said the Audit/Finance Committee last week endorsed this levy unanimously and believes the City Commission should do the same thing. He was at the BBQ fundraiser on Saturday and has personally provided financial assistance for the PAC. He supports the levy and thinks the committee is doing a heck of a job and will support them in any way he can, but he does not feel with the concessions being asked of employees the city should be giving \$3,000 to the PAC.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, 2. Nays: Brett Fuqua, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar, Craig Stahl, 5. The President declared the motion failed.

Brett Fuqua asked if it would be appropriate for the city to pass a Resolution to support this issue. Don Icsman said the city already did by virtue of this being on the ballot. He said city employees received a flyer with their most recent paychecks supporting the levy and asked the City Commission to speak to the appropriateness of city staff spending time and effort conveying information about the levy so there is no misconception from the public. Don Icsman said his concern would be for employees helping put information together during the workday like Ed Widman has done recently for the PAC.

Upon motion of Brett Fuqua and second of Julie Farrar, the Commission was requested to authorize employees to spend a diminutive amount of time to work on and support the levy.

Discussion: Dan Kaman asked what more the Commissioners want to do. He said staff has talked on the radio, the Commissioners placed the issue on the ballot and he was not sure how much more promoting the city should be doing. Brett Fuqua said his intention is to allow staff to help get information out. Don Icsman said what concerns him, in particular, with the flyer, is we could have problems if it is not approved by the Commissioners. Although this does not generate an expenditure of funds, it is an in-kind donation and effort is being exerted to promote the levy. Dan Kaman asked what decision involves the City Commission's approval and asked what we have done in the past. Craig Stahl said they were

looking at approving small amounts of time and/or materials by staff members for the levy. Don Icsman said we would do this for anyone, whether for or against the levy, and will answer any questions too. Ed Widman said when the Fire Levy was on the ballot before he did not recall any staff working on this campaign during the workday, nor did he recall any copies being made or office equipment being used to promote it. During the Marina District project, staff time was allowed to work on the project with the Commission's approval. Ed Widman said he was always told to do nothing or do it on your own time. Craig Stahl said he was on the SFD Levy Committee and did remember city employees attending meetings during the day. Julie Farrar said her understanding by seconding this motion was to cover any employee so that if someone says they saw a city employee doing work for a levy or for a PAC, it has been approved. They are being allowed to spend minimal time but not money.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Julie Farrar, Craig Stahl, 5. Nays: Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, 2. The President declared the motion passed.

Matt Kline said **bids have been received for trash hauling, leaf collection and recycling** and a spreadsheet will be put together for the Commission's consideration. Pervis Brown asked who bid and Matt Kline indicated Allied Waste and FSI submitted bids. Brett Fuqua asked for clarification whether the bids were separated by refuse, recycling and yard waste and Matt Kline said this is how the specifications were prepared, in addition to leaf collection only for this year. Brett Fuqua said he has been bombarded with calls from local haulers and objects to the refuse portion of the bid. Bob Warner asked if bidders were given the option to bid on only one zone rather than all five and Matt Kline said they were. Bob Warner asked how much time was given for the bidders to respond and Matt Kline indicated there was a three-week time period given. Bob Warner said he thought the haulers must take the time to prepare something for the city's consideration as these services cannot continue to be provided as they are currently and changes need to be made within one year. Bob Warner asked if the haulers could be given another 30 days to participate and indicated the worst thing they (the haulers) could do is to not participate in the process. Julie Farrar said she would also like us to allow another 30 days to respond and Matt Kline said we would have to go through the entire procedure again as two companies did participate this time. Matt Kline indicated he has not reviewed all of the numbers yet, but it appears there would be substantial cuts to the cost for garbage and yard waste; at a glance, he currently pays \$66/quarter for refuse and an additional \$21/quarter for yard waste. Using numbers from the bids received, this could be reduced by well over 50%. Matt Kline said if you consider there are over 8,300 homes in Sandusky, this is a considerable savings for the consumer. Craig Stahl said he is a small business guy and he does not feel the city should be putting these people who are unique to our community out of business. Dave Waddington agreed and stated he is all for recycling and is glad this was bid separately; he did not feel the haulers have a problem with this. He said he did not want to see the smaller businesses run out of town; this affects families that have been in this community for years and he suggested we look at a way of grandfathering current haulers. Dave Waddington said he supports local businesses and the small haulers are making a lot of their purchases here and are raising their families here. He said he cannot look these people in the eye and feel good about this. He would be okay with recycling and leaves separately. Dave Waddington also said he looked at the bid specs and thinks they are way off track from where this started and we had been considering a drop-off point when we were 99% sure of getting a grant. He said small haulers with one or two trucks cannot handle 8,300 homes. Bob Warner said he is not advocating putting anyone out of business but he would like the haulers to participate in the process to find out the separate costs for recycling and yard waste. He has gotten a cost of \$10.50/quarter to recycle from his own hauler which is reasonable and much less than it was six months ago. Brett Fuqua said he believes this is where some of the confusion is coming from as some people thought we were looking for one number for everything, but this is not the case. He said we should be looking at proposals for recycling and yard waste and let the trash/garbage alone. Matt Kline asked if this is a cost the city will pick up or, rather, if it will be passed on to the consumers choosing to participate. For curbside recycling, the cost is projected to be \$4/home which would generate \$33,000/month if all households in the city participated. Currently, the county is spending about \$33,000/year for the recycling bins. He said for this price, the city could keep the recycling bins and pass the cost on to the consumers instead of going to curbside recycling. Craig Stahl said we should let this issue go for tonight and try to come back with a workable plan which will keep the local haulers happy. Pervis Brown suggested scheduling a special meeting with the haulers for this purpose. Julie Farrar said residents have always chosen their own hauler and it is a personal choice who takes their trash. She does not feel we can make people recycle, rake leaves or trim trees. Craig Stahl then asked to schedule a special meeting on October 19 at 5 p.m. to discuss this issue further. Dave Waddington stated it was getting late in the year to make a decision about leaf pickup and Matt Kline said we have already announced the city will pick up leaves in bags only.

Upon motion of Dan Kaman and second of Julie Farrar, the Commission voted to reject all of the bids received and notify the haulers. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed.

Dan Kaman suggested County Commissioners Bill Monaghan and Pat Shenigo attend this meeting due to the recycling and landfill problems Erie County is facing.

Dan Kaman spoke about the recent **Triple Crown trail derailment on the west end** and said this is the second time in two years this has happened. He wondered why this has not happened with other train cars travelling on the same curve. Dan Kaman suggested writing a letter to the railroad about this as they are not going anywhere and they are a growing industry and we do not yet have an overpass. He said he does not like the plan for the overpass as it is not perfect, but it was agreed upon six years ago and would be better than what we have now. Dan Kaman said we need to move forward with this and the derailment is a perfect example of why we need the overpass. He said the city needs to take the ball and move this forward. Brett Fuqua asked if there is a speed limit on the tracks and Don Icsman indicated this is set by Federal Law and the Railroad Safety Act. Trains are required to be in continuous movement and not block intersections but this happens too and it is frustrating. Matt Kline said this is the first derailment which has occurred since he has been here. Dan Kaman said he would like the city to prepare a letter to ODOT about the reasons we need an overpass and another to the railroad requesting an explanation for the recent train derailment.

NEW BUSINESS:

Dave Waddington said he was a panelist at a meeting held today at the Sandusky Library with State Treasurer, Kevin Boyce, State Representative, Dennis Murray and about 20 other people regarding energy conservation. Dave Waddington distributed pamphlets about this program designed to help Ohio cities save money, create jobs and reduce Ohio's carbon footprint. He said the state has developed the **Energy Conservation for Ohioans (ECO-Link) program** to offer reduced rate financing at 3% through partnering banks to Ohioans completing energy efficient improvements in their homes like stoves, refrigerators, doors and roofs. Dave Waddington also said Representative Murray told him he is working in Columbus on solar energy and the geothermal concept is looking better as some of the roadblocks are now out of the way. Matt Kline stated he recently met with Jim Hardin of Hardin Geotech and they will be making a presentation at the next City Commission meeting. Matt Kline said since they were here before, Hardin has come up with a plan for private financing.

Upon motion of Brett Fuqua and second of Dave Waddington, Lacy Davis was reappointed to serve on the Human Relations Commission for a 5-year term which will expire on October 10, 2014. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed.

On motion of Brett Fuqua and second of Pervis Brown, the Commissioners voted to hold an Executive Session regarding Personnel, City Commission. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed.

On motion of Pervis Brown and second of Dan Kaman, the Commissioners voted to give a five percent (5%) wage reduction to all Administrative employees including the City Manager and Commissioners. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman and Julie Farrar, 6. Nays: Craig Stahl, 1. The President declared the motion passed.

OLD BUSINESS:

Dan Kaman said at the last meeting, he asked about **fees collected for parking on the Jackson Street Pier**. He asked if some of the monies generated, which amounted to \$17,000 - \$20,000, could be used to fill potholes and make repairs to the Jackson Street parking lot behind the State Theatre and then make this a "pay-to-park" lot. He said the City of Port Clinton and the Jet Express has done this successfully. Dave Waddington said we should look into the costs for this first and Don Icsman indicated the city could designate this lot for paid parking. Brett Fuqua asked how this would be monitored and Dan Kaman said we could fence the lot in and put gates up.

Craig Stahl questioned the motion **cutting the Administrative employees' pay by five percent**. He said only 14 or 15 of these employees touch the General Fund budget. He said these are the same employees who now contribute to health care premiums, who did not receive raises this year and some have already volunteered to take pay cuts by as much as 10%. Craig Stahl said he did not believe this was fair to these employees and Don Icsman indicated it would be appropriate for the Commission to allow these employees to rescind their offers to be fair.

On motion of Julie Farrar and second of Brett Fuqua, the Commissioners authorized those city employees who have just had their pay cut and also made voluntary concessions the ability to rescind their offer(s).

Discussion: Dan Kaman said he would support the motion as he believes it is across the board for everybody and will set the tone during union negotiations that we are all doing the same thing. He said there were offers from Charter Officers, Firefighters and Commissioners and they all amounted to different percentages. Matt Kline said he felt it was unfair to penalize the Administrative employees, especially those who do not touch the General Fund. He said the deepest cuts to date have been from the Administrative personnel and these are the same employees who did not get a raise this year and who now contribute to their health care premiums. Matt Kline said when he came here there were over 40 personnel in Administration; the remaining Administrative employees have been asked to take on more responsibility with the cuts made. He said in order to make the \$1.5 million in cuts necessary, he would need to eliminate 14 full-time equivalents (FTE) in Administration and further cuts would still be needed, including the elimination of 12 Police Officers and four Firefighters. This salary reduction will only save the General Fund about \$5,000 or \$6,000 if it had been at 3% like he has heard. Matt Kline said a lot has been asked of the personnel in Administration and they have stepped up to the plate. He said if the City Commissioners wish to cut his pay, he does have a contract which would need to be renegotiated; further, Matt Kline said he would gladly take the pay cut but wishes they would just talk to him first. He feels the other Administrative employees are not being treated fairly. Craig Stahl then stated he would rescind his approval for 10% of his pay to go back to the city and will instead donate it to the PAC for the Income Tax levy.

Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman and Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 7. Nays: 0. The President declared the motion passed.

Julie Farrar thanked the City Commissioners, on behalf of Rachel Luttmann of SHS, for their **contribution for the FRAM**.

Dan Kaman asked Chief Charlie Sams to give an overview of the **process for calls involving pit bulls**. Charlie Sams stated two officers have been assigned Animal Control Officer duties and they are Officers Gardin and Braun. They split the week for work shift purposes and after 6 p.m., any Police Officer may respond to an animal call and follow-up work is then performed by Officers Gardin or Braun. There are certain protocols followed and we have been working through these with the County Dog Warden as the State law is different than our local Ordinances. Dan Kaman asked about the insurance and registration process and Charlie Sams stated they were working with the Law Department to clarify how this information is collected.

Ed Widman asked for clarification of the **effective date for the five percent pay reduction** and Craig Stahl said this should become effective with the next pay period.

Under **Audience Participation**, Darlene Armour, 1007 Wayne Street, said approximately six months ago, Lisa Beurksen from the Erie County Solid Waste District spoke to the City Commission regarding State compliance issues which will need to be in place by August, 2010. She was glad to see a meeting has been scheduled to address the obstacles with our local haulers. She did not believe the City Commissioners should be taking the blame for these changes in the law.

Tim Schwanger, 362 Sheffield Way, said some years ago the city increased its ambulance fees which were all to have been set aside for the purchase of additional equipment. He recalled this was not always done and some of these monies went toward the General Fund and sees this could happen with the additional Income Tax monies even though he heard today that 74% of these monies would go to our Safety Services. He said he was amazed a City Commissioner would recommend the expenditure of \$3,000 to be used to promote a levy and, likewise, he would recommend giving \$3,000 to Diedre Cole's campaign.

John Ginty, 5055 Providence Drive, said the Ordinance for demolition of homes was passed tonight and there are no assurances that hazardous materials are not contained in what goes to the landfill and he would not want to see the county come back on the city for this. He feels there should be some follow-up if we are to allow people to go in and buy things before the demolition contracts are let. John Ginty also asked for an update on the Jiimaan Dock. Matt Kline said the officials from Pelee Island have asked the city to leave this dock in place for now as they are considering the use of a front-end loading vessel for Sandusky.

Diedre Cole, 807 Hancock Street, said economic times are tough and we should set aside our frustrations and not fight and bicker. She stated the practice of government employees endorsing a political idea is a dangerous slope and employees should not be allowed to support or defend an issue. The ballot issue will pass or fail on its own merits.

Dr. Kirk Halliday of the Mental Health & Recovery Board (MHRB) of Erie and Ottawa County, 416 Columbus Avenue, asked for the Commissioner's support of the levy issue on the ballot for funding mental health services. Dr. Halliday said MHRB has a contract with numerous local agencies for services and has a \$9 million budget, 40% of which is funded through the local tax levy. He stated good mental health is a public health concern and his agency provides a safety net with their services. The current levy issue is 3/10 of one percent and is a five-year replacement levy which would cost a \$100,000 homeowner about \$9/year. The agency's administrative costs have been cut by 14% with only 7% of their overall budget now used for this purpose which is low. He requested the City Commissioner's support for passage of this levy. Bob Warner stated he is a member of the Board and has not used their services, but has some friends and family members who have.

Bob Warner then made a motion to support this tax levy which was seconded by Dan Kaman. Roll Call on the motion: Yeas: Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman and Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 6. Nays: 0. Abstain: Bob Warner, 1. The President declared the motion passed.

John Hamilton, 165 Sunset Drive, stated he finds it commendable for the Commissioners to martyr themselves regarding their pay; he does not know what it is like to earn a six-digit income but he knows how to squeeze nickels into quarters and suggested looking at how we purchase our police cruisers. He does not feel we need cars with big motors and could save money on gasoline by making different purchases. He suggested talking to some of the people using our equipment to see what ideas they have. He also understands the blue color we use for our vehicles is out of the ordinary and costs more money to produce and suggested a magnetic sign with our emblem for vehicles rather than paint.

Sue Daugherty, 1016 Third Street, asked the Commissioners to consider making a public presentation about the Moody's report and if a big enough audience were there, it would be time well invested. Sue Daugherty also asked for a progress report for the next 30-day period for the Chesapeake project relative to the goal. She asked the Commissioners to clarify the contents of the letter being written to ODOT about the overpass project and Dan Kaman said we are looking for answers about what is being done, when and by whom.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said the suggestion of a \$3,000 donation is absurd, insensitive to an unbalanced budget, and questioned why the city and the SFD are campaigning as a PAC. She did not believe city employees should be campaigning with tax dollars. Chief Mike Meinzer said there is a balancing act with this issue and there are consequences if the levy were to fail. He said the PAC was started by members of the IAFF union and he (Chief Meinzer) was asked to speak at a recent meeting about how the failure of the levy would impact the Fire Department and then let the voters decide whether to keep all stations open. Don Icsman said the city does provide services and these are paid for through Income Tax. He said the city should not be advocating for other levies, but this is our tax and our services and there is no other place to get this information. He said what the city can do is provide honest facts. Sharon Johnson also said it was an act of desperation to reduce administrative employees' salaries by five percent in order to help pass the Income Tax.

Andre Grant, 1900 West Jefferson Street, asked about clearing a mound of dirt and trees at the end of Mills Street where the Bike Path is being installed for better and clearer access to the water. He said there are some residents who have offered to help with this. Andre Grant stated he was for the increase in Income Tax and encouraged people to vote for it as we need our safety services. He also stated he did not want to put any haulers out of business. He asked for consideration to create a Fast Pitch team for Sandusky similar to Huron because of all of the people who would participate.

Dennis Timple, 553 Bimini Drive, said Dan Kaman stated the overpass plan was agreed to six years ago but he recalls arguments back in 1963 about this project.

Craig Stahl adjourned the regular session of the Sandusky City Commission meeting at 8:03 p.m.

An Executive Session was held on Personnel, City Commission.

At 8:30 p.m., the City Commissioners returned to the table and the meeting adjourned.

Kelly L. Kresser
Interim Clerk of the City Commission

Craig H. Stahl
President of the City Commission