

THURSDAY

FEBRUARY 19, 2009

5:00 P.M.

At 5:00 p.m. a Special Meeting was held by the Sandusky City Commission in the City Building Commission Chambers, 222 Meigs Street, to discuss the 2009 Budget with City Commissioners Julie Farrar, Craig Stahl, Brett Fuqua, Pervis Brown-5:03 p.m., Bob Warner, and Dave Waddington in attendance; as well as the Charter Officers of the City Manager Matthew D. Kline, Law Director Don Icsman, Finance Director Ed Widman and the Clerk of the City Commission B. Joyce Brown; the Administrative Staff of Director of Engineering Services Kathy McKillips, Fire Chief Mike Meinzer, Interim Police Chief Charlie Sams, Economic Development Specialist Scott Schell and Senior Accountant/Auditor Hank Solowiej; as well as the Department Heads of General Services Superintendent Scott Miller, Park & Recreation Director Michelle Hall, Events Coordinator Judy Nagy, Horticultural Services Director Mike Pisarsky, Fleet Maintenance Forum Troy Vaccaro. The audience and the news media were present.

Mr. Kaman offered the **invocation** and everyone remained standing for the **Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag**.

The Clerk called the **roll** and the following Commissioners responded: Farrar, Stahl, Fuqua, Brown, Warner, Waddington, and Kaman.

President Stahl said with no other business before them this evening, other than an executive session if it's so called, which would be to discuss the budget, they can do this a couple ways; he thought it was the desire for everybody to go through each department of tax revenue. By whole departments the revenue is applicable if anybody feels any differently about this process, could they please let him know. There being none, they would plan on going in two-hour sessions. They would go to 7:00 p.m. and plan on taking a break from 7:00 p.m. to 7:15 p.m.; and if they go that far, then they'll take another break at 9:00 p.m. to 9:15 p.m. If they can get it done quicker, that's better.

President Stahl said they would start with the **Police Department**, Chief Sams, his proposed Budget for 2009 Wages & Fringes of \$3,402,060. Interim Chief Sams said that was the salaries for the Patrol Division for this department. It is what it is. President Stahl said Travel & Training of \$25,000. Interim Chief Sams said that's correct. President Stahl said Contractual Services was \$112,413, was there any way to shave anything out of that? Interim Chief Sams said no, and he had an outline of, he would like to go over it. For Contractual Services they have basically \$200 for claims administration, which is what they get every year. Civil Service Testing they have \$1,800 put aside for any Civil Service Testing that comes along. They have their BAC, which is their BAC Maintenance, which is the machine that tests DUI's. That's about \$500 a year for upkeep. They have a \$100 for Federal Express, \$500 for Package Central for shipping. They have Ohio Chiefs of Police and International Chiefs of Police Association Memberships of \$195 and \$120 a year. They have car washes of \$6,000, legal reviews \$6,000, \$3,000 put aside for psychological testing, officer's physicals they had \$34,744 and that's contractual, \$8,000 for fitness service maintenance for their equipment. Video Maintenance, which is contractual they have \$9,700 for the in-car cruiser videos. They have \$50 put aside for a port-a-potty out at the firing range. Wellness Testing they have \$1,000 put aside for that. The Nextel Phone Service is about \$9,000 or Nextel Care Cards Service is \$8,100. Their LEADS Service with the State, which is where they run license plates and everything through, is \$9,300. The Buckeye Cable Internet Service for the department is about \$780. They had \$3,000 set aside for building repairs, both for this building and their COP Station. Cruiser calibration, which is to calibrate their radar in their cars, was \$630. Promotional Testing was \$5,000 set aside and Promotional Testing and Laser and Radar Calibration was \$120. They had a \$1,000 set aside for all shred services, which was for the public records and record retention to shred documents. They have \$3,000 set aside in computer repairs; \$1,200 for business cards and paperwork; City e-mail was \$1,350 and employee screening is \$500. Their charge backs for copies made on the City's copy machine was \$500. They had approximately \$1,000 in recruitment supplies and recruiting for the department. DUI and urine testing for those to refuse the BAC or unable to take the BAC is \$2,460. School Resource

Officers dues are \$39. Their fire protection equipment was \$150 and dock installation, which they split with the Fire Department, their share of that was \$375 at the Boat Ramp. *President Stahl asked did anybody have any questions on Contractual Services for the Police Department.*

Mrs. Farrar said she was curious about computer repairs, our men in our computer department don't work here on our computers? Interim Chief Sams said no. Well, if it's something they can do, but if it has to be something that's repaired or replaced. If they have to take it to Broken Acres or one of the other establishments, and it's not just for computers, it's for any kind of equipment repairs like the copy machine or technology things.

Mr. Fuqua said Nextel, he didn't really understand the purpose of that, was that cell phones, and why do you guys need cell phones if they communicate through the radio and things? Interim Chief Sams said the Detective Bureau and Administrative Staff don't. They get e-mails and two-ways on theirs, because when you're doing undercover work you don't want that going over the air. Mr. Fuqua said okay.

Mr. Warner said he had seen him in his office and they went over a lot of this stuff here a couple of times. These amounts are what he budgeted for. He don't always use everything that's in this budget on some of these. And it was hard for him to pin down exactly to the penny how much he was going to spend on computer services and he may not use that. And what he doesn't use he turns back in to the General Fund. He just wanted people to know. Interim Chief Sams said that's correct, he was absolutely right. Mr. Tom Whitted, IT said a comment on the Nextel Air Cards, they've got a state price on them now so that the price will actually be cheaper starting next month. So that would drop and probably save us about 25%, which he just found out about today.

President Stahl said Supplies and Materials of \$148,112. Interim Chief Sams said the first one is the biggest one, which is fuel of \$120,000 besides the fuel. Now that could be significantly lower. Last year they only budgeted \$90,000 or \$95,000, which they went over slightly and gas was up to four bucks a gallon. Well it's dropped down to roughly \$1.90 now. He's hoping that that is significantly lower, but he has budgeted \$120,000 assuming that it is going to jack back up. The duty supplies were \$2,000, which would be CPR First Aid Masks; \$72 was equipment for the firearms range such as fire arm supplies, clay targets was \$120 to \$300. BAC tickets, which were the forms you stick into the BAC mirror fire machine to get out the readings is \$148. There's \$200 in for a new TV/VCR Monitor that reports our building recordings. There is \$76 in ear plugs, \$500 in lithium batteries; \$107 in flashlight batteries; \$1,500 in badges; \$300 civil service testing; office and paper supplies is \$8,000; \$350 for a filing cabinet; computer supplies in the building and the cars is approximately \$6,000; BAC simulator solution is \$116; Laptop treatments for the in-car cruiser is \$4,000; Animal Control Supplies for our new Animal Control Officer is \$4,000; and DUI blood & urine test kit is \$320. Going back to the Animal Control supplies we got to get four traps sizes 36x10x12, a Tomahawk Live Trap Company is costing basically \$500. Test product supplies, which include cat food, kitty litter, dog food and different types of food, etc. they were guessing between \$2,000 to \$3,000, because this is the first year we've had Animal Control so we're working on things and it depends on how many traps. They've also got about a \$1,000 incorporated in for possible veterinary costs, because they're responsible if some of these animals are injured. And they also put in \$145 for a catch all pool and another \$200 for shipping and handling total for that and that's to help him catch the animals. So that's it for supplies. *President Stahl asked were there any questions for the Assistant Chief?*

Mrs. Farrar said are we supposed to get animal control supplies through Gallagher's? Interim Chief Sams said if as long as they are in business. He believed he heard that they may not be in business much longer, but they have been dealing with them. Mrs. Farrar said as far as badges did he mean for street uniforms, the shield? Interim Chief Sams said the shield, they added eight new officers last year and when they make their probation they get a badge that has their number identifying them as an officer. Right now they're using temporary badges.

Mr. Kaman asked did all of our cars have videos? Interim Chief Sams said yes, all of our marked cruisers. Mr. Kaman asked how many speed radars do we have? Interim Chief Sams said we have radars for a laser for every cruiser. Mr. Kaman said clay targets, he knows he shoots at them, but what are we using those for? Interim

Chief Sams said initial shooting during qualifications, they qualify those with a rifle or shotgun.

Mr. Waddington said what about our new cameras they're going to put in the cars? Interim Chief Sams said they have a budget and they will have them and it's not going to cost us any money.

President Stahl said Major Expenses. Interim Chief Sams said Major Expendables there were \$4,000 set aside for replacement of some of the cruiser radios, which are antiquated and need to be placed. They have \$44,800 set aside for the new hires, she gets a ballistic vest and they have \$5,600 set aside for ballistic vests for veteran officers that have expired. There is \$1,500 for the Detective Bureau to replace undercover radio replacement. Department ammunition is \$15,255 and for their rifle ammunition it is \$1,050. That's it.

Mr. Brown asked if this year in '08 did we spend \$3,546,550 and this year our total expenses we're spending \$3,719,000, which is an increase of more than \$200,000? Interim Chief Sams asked was he talking about the wages or the total budget for the patrol division? Mr. Brown said yea, he jumped it. Interim Chief Sams said a big portion is our patrol officers got a 3½% raise this year.

President Stahl said does any of the Commissioners think it's important to go over all the non-uniform police, police reserves, marine patrol and detectives; do they want to do it line by line?

Mr. Kaman said he would like to know about the patrol boat, it is all zeroes this year; he would like to know what the plan is? Interim Chief Sams said the plan is they are going to participate in a regional patrol effort with the County and Huron and it's all funded by the federal government. Our only cost will be four hours and it can be shared by all of the departments, four hours a week of regular time from an officer. And they will participate in that, so it's already built into the budget. Mr. Kaman said okay. Is that four hours per week per one officer or are they to have more? Interim Chief Sams said there will be more officers on the boat, but they will be paid by the federal government. They will be paid through overtime by the feds, but it will cost them. Not necessarily will cost the City four hours a week, there would have to be four hours of regular time put on the boat used by one of the agencies, which we will do some of the time. Mr. Kaman asked how many officers would we have on the boat at a time, plus Sandusky? Interim Chief Sams said they were still working on those details with the federal government and getting this all approved. They believed there would be two to three officers on the boat at a time. They don't have the final figures of how often they want the boat out and they would have to sit down with other agencies in the County and see how they want to spread it out.

President Stahl asked was Huron in or out, because he was hearing both, are they in on this deal? Interim Chief Sams said Randy Glovinsky told him he were in. President Stahl said they have a boat correct? Interim Chief Sams said so did we and we gave ours back. President Stahl said so are they going to turn their state boat back in? Interim Chief Sams said he didn't know if they were necessarily going to do that. They can participate both ways. They can do their own state boat and participate in the County boat. That's up to them. But Chief Glovinsky personally told him, they had a meeting with the Sheriff, Huron and Perkins and he said he was in. President Stahl said he was just surprised when somebody told him Huron wasn't getting rid of their boat. It surprised him that we got rid of our boat and they're not getting rid of their boat. Interim Chief Sams said well there's a cost to keeping that boat and we're going to have to have matching funds to get paid for that and with the federal boat we don't have to have matching funds.

Mrs. Farrar asked what type of contractual services do we have in the Police Pension category? Interim Chief Sams said that would be for Mr. Widman or Hank. Mr. Solowiej said typically we wouldn't have any debt service that went on, any bond counsel fees or financial advisor's fees. That's another one of those numbers that depends upon if we are refinancing a note or issue, we may not have it. We've tried looking at that historically what that's been.

Mr. Kaman said it would be a County controlled boat basically with our involvement, are we still keeping it where we kept it at our dock or are we keeping it someplace else? Interim Chief Sams said he believed we would be keeping it in Sandusky at that dock. Mr. Kaman said when this is all finalized, if he could get the finalized plan of how it's happening, how many years, etc. Interim Chief Sams said absolutely.

President Stahl said the Police Department total budget is \$5,260,832 and last year's comparison was \$5,013,138, basically a difference would be that Mr. Brown was referring to would be your labor costs.

Mr. Kaman asked how many officers is he down compared to putting him up to standards? Interim Chief Sams said full-time was three.

Mr. Warner asked are we going to look into the new grants that are out there and maybe bring back the full-time officers? Interim Chief Sams said absolutely, they are looking at all of the COP grants. They were looking at other GREAT (Gang Resistance Educational Assistance and Training) Grant and there were several others allotments that they were looking at. Discussion ensued.

Mr. Brown asked what would it cost to bring an officer into the department? Interim Chief Sams said to hire a new officer would be about \$68,000 total with pension, medical and all of those things added.

President Stahl asked did they want to talk about the revenues that affect the Police Department, but it's so insignificant.

President Stahl said they would go to the **Fire Department**. Fire Chief Meinzer said he would go through the wages first. Their Wages & Fringes were proposed at \$4,341,188. He could break that down to general full-time employment. The 2008 Budget was \$2,799,064; a 3% base increase would have been about \$84,000 with the raises going to the three non-union employees, the Assistant Chief, Administrative Assistant and himself. And they've eliminated another Battalion Chief, a total of two Battalion Chiefs... President Stahl interrupted and said he just said the raises were going to the non-union people, he thinks he misspoke, because... Chief Meinzer said with no raises going to the three non-union employees. And eliminating their two Battalion Chiefs, there was another Battalion Chief this year replacing number two firefighters, there was a cut of \$11,500 for no holiday pay, no overtime, now its regular wages and everyone's for free for full-time wages. Our premium pay, a 3% base would have added about \$2,386. So they actually reduced it by \$6,686. They had an employee that was off last year for a year who didn't get a separation, but left and that was a Battalion Chief so that should cut back on the overtime this year hopefully.

Chief Meinzer said Longevity, the base was for \$44,155; last year would have been \$1,325. They cut that by \$3,060, because the seniority and longevity they lost a couple of officers last year that had more seniority.

Chief Meinzer said Holiday Pay is a big item on their pay range, its \$200,000. Our firefighters have to work holidays. The base is 3% and they had \$6,000 and we were able to cut it by \$8,105 because of the Battalion Chief. The two Battalion Chiefs that are left, they put them on days so they are no longer eligible for holiday pay; so that's \$197,994.

Chief Meinzer said the Education Bonuses are \$87,432 and last year the base would have been \$2,623. They have an obligation of \$5,070. That was one line item that actually went up. That's because they hired in the place of Battalion Chiefs, anyone else for paramedic increases, at least these people they replaced them with are paramedics and they get a paramedic bonus for education. So that's a total of \$95,125.

Chief Meinzer said Uniform allowance, they moved to another line item, but that's \$36,700 to buy the uniforms, but that's not in wages and benefits. That was moved down in the supplies now.

Chief Meinzer said Medicare was \$42,079. Last year their base would have been \$1,262. They went up \$363. That's all new employees have to pay in Medicare for pre-1980 and employees that retired before that are not covered by Medicare and are not paying in Medicare. He was not sure about the date yet, but we half the part we pay Medicare for it and half of dental. Mr. Widman said April 1, 1986.

Chief Meinzer said Worker's Comp was \$97,985 and the base would have been around \$2,934. They had an obligation of \$4,006 and they had a little bit less of a \$196 decrease or \$104,528.

Chief Meinzer said they had one employee under PERS for \$7,038. The budget last year would have went up to \$11,000. It decreased \$205 and he can't remember why; it was probably because of the rate.

Chief Meinzer said Health insurance was up obviously \$73,727. Last year the base would have been \$22,136 obligation because of the increased health insurance amount \$6,145 over last year for \$766,161.

Chief Meinzer said Safety & Equipment was moved into Supplies also. Chief Meinzer said and the last thing was Inter-department Labor that they had under Wages & Benefits and that was \$43,649 last year and they have stopped the practice of transferring inter-departmental labor between budgets. So that is not showing up in that. So there is a \$4,341,188 for the proposed 2009 Budget.

President Stahl said he seemed to have everything, but Major Expenses. Chief Meinzer said he didn't hit any of that. That was just Wages & Benefits right there. That was the first line. President Stahl asked were there any questions of Chief Meinzer on Wages & Benefits?

Mr. Kaman said he just had one employee under PERS for what cost to us? Chief Meinzer said the one employee under PERS and pension for the PERS employee was \$7,038. A 3% increase to that would have been \$211, is what he was saying. But now that it's increased on the pension, because there was taxes on Longevity, it went up by \$4 over last year.

President Stahl said he wanted to compliment him on a no-wage budget and thinking outside the box. It's \$4,333,000 change to \$4,341,000 this year with changing some people around, those Battalion Chiefs and doing a little reorganization. He personally he congratulated him. Chief Meinzer said each year they have been trying to get more cost effective. It's just harder and harder and they have been trying since '02. Some things just have to go through attrition, etc.

Mr. Warner asked where was he with our staffing levels, where we're supposed to be? Chief Meinzer said National Fire Protection Association Standards we are five short a day, which would be over 15 extra employees. If you went by NFPAS 1710, 1710 is OSHA and NFPA Standards, but they were down six personnel from 2003 and they have eliminated two Battalion Chiefs and one Lieutenant's position right now.

Mr. Warner asked how much has our call volume increased since the last three years? Chief Meinzer said he knows this past year it's increased 3%, that's pretty difficult. He knows since '96 its increased 50%, 49½% since 1996 their run volume. And he thinks that's indicative of our seniors. The people in Sandusky here are getting older and there's a need for the EMS, the emergency transport has increased. Mr. Warner said well our personnel has gone down and our run volume's gone up. Chief Meinzer said we're six under over 2003. We have 12 people on duty, the National Standard recommends 17. Mr. Warner said instead of asking our people to do more with less, we don't have to ask them, they are doing it. Chief Meinzer said there's not much more that they can do with less.

Mr. Warner said he also asked him today about his five grants for staffing up to the National Standards. Chief Meinzer said there is a grant to bring your department up to NFPA's 1710 levels. We have never applied for it before, because they've been asked to reduce. There are a few things that you have to do, you have to staff your engines, you have to put four people on an engine. They strive to keep three on an engine and there are many times that they don't have two on an engine, which is very unsafe. But they try to keep three on an engine, but you'd have to make a commitment for five years to keep four on an engine and four on the ladder truck, which would put 17 people on a day on their department instead of 12. The problem was before, it was a five-year commitment, much like the COP Station, remember the first year you had to match 10% of their wages, first it was 20, then it was 50 and then it was 70 (%), and in the fifth year you had to pay all, one hundred percent for all those 15 to 20 employees that would have been hired. So knowing that things weren't looking great, they never applied for that grant. Even the 10% would have been tough. This Stimulus Package has a component in there that allows for \$210 billion he thinks, that allows for building fire stations and it also is going to add some money for that Safer Grant. And the first five years they've wiped away that 10, 20, 50, 70 (%) and you don't have to pay, but at five years you still got that 100% commitment that you got to work to keep the firefighters on.

Mr. Warner said and they talked further on if the City was leaning towards placing the equipment in different fire houses. Could he explain that? Chief Meinzer said automatic aid, he thinks that's when they talked about the initiative, start of this has been slowed down here lately, but the initiative had been started by their department when they did cut staffing in '04, '05 he believed. And it was to have a multi-jurisdictional dispatching where Margaretta, Huron, Perkins and Sandusky would all be combined in one dispatch community with the County or wherever they wanted to

put it. They proposed the Council of Governments; however, the administrator who governed things, that's not what he was worried about, but the concept is in the SAFER (Staffing Standards for Adequate Fire Emergency Response) Grant after you do this that moves you up on the list for getting these grants if you already have an automatic agreement. And it would work with the computer and the dispatch center would recognize where the closest vehicle is, regardless of who owned it or what jurisdiction they're from. They recognize that if Huron's ambulance was coming back from the hospital from Firelands Hospital and there was an ambulance call on Columbus Avenue and they were in that block, there's a vehicle position locator and they would get that call. Different communities would get the call based on the ladder truck could be coming from Perkins. Like right now they do not staff their ladder truck on a lot of calls. We do have some high rise buildings. We have the Harbour Building east of Columbus Avenue where they may not have anybody driving ladder truck and that's an important piece of equipment if you have a building over three stories. If you live over three stories, you want to see a ladder truck pulling up to your place when it's on fire. Where automatic dispatching would bring the closest ladder truck in; the computer makes the recommendation. That station would be alerted, that truck would be sent on official's response.

Mr. Warner said if we do that, it would reduce the cost for the City of Sandusky having to buy so much equipment. Let's say if your community needed a new ladder truck, it might be Margaretta that buys a new ladder truck and Sandusky wouldn't have to buy one on our own. So that would reduce our costs on what kind of equipment we would have to buy, large purchases. Chief Meinzer said the Fire Chiefs have been, being in Erie County, together and trying to address some technical rescues that way. With hazard materials spills, it's something that you don't have a lot, but when you have them you need all of the equipment to clean them up. You need the suits and everything so that people are safe. So what they do is they purchase the equipment together and they train together and they have several people. Mr. Warner said so if they do that, the money they collect every year from the ambulance runs would drop several hundred thousand dollars. We wouldn't have to spend all that money on equipment every year and at the end of the five years we could afford people that are on that SAFER Grant or we would be closer to being able to afford it. Chief Meinzer said that's the idea. They are trying to replace their equipment every 15 to 20 years cycle with our EMS Funds. That's what they passed that for and it did generate \$700,000 this year. That would be a big burden if it was in the Operating Budget to replace fire trucks. Mr. Warner said okay, there is a grant out there and at the end of that five years there's a way that we could maybe band with the County within that five years and band all the fire departments together and reduce our equipment costs so it wouldn't be quite so much and use maybe some of that to help pay for the firefighters. Chief Meinzer said he didn't want to speak for other jurisdictions, but the comment this evening of starting to build a fire station collectively, where you start building a fire station where it's needed regardless of whose jurisdiction that is, then that would be the concept that everybody would work together on.

Mr. Kaman said they're talking about that, Mr. Warner he himself has tried for five or six years and the old Chief has been talking about it for ten. So some people in the County just want to play and that's the sad reality of it. And Chief Meinzer has even talked about that for at least 11 or 12 years if he was not mistaken. Chief Meinzer said but he has files that go back several Fire Chiefs back that long, he hasn't personally been working on it. He's only been the Fire Chief for four years. Mr. Kaman said it's not Sandusky that doesn't want to cooperate with the rest of the County that's for sure. Mr. Warner said he understood, but he talked to the Chief and we do have partners out there that want to play with us. We have some that don't want to play; we've got partners that do want to play. And if we play with those partners and play our cards right, it could help our department help the other departments. If we're all getting along together and the ones that don't want to get along together will have to come in sooner or later, they can't stay on that island by themselves forever. Mr. Kaman said he was looking forward to that day.

Mr. Kaman asked what was his percentage of EMS runs and percentage to fire runs? Chief Meinzer said our EMS runs are typically 79%; to fire and rescue, hazard conditions is about 20%. Mr. Waddington said and where would them 79% runs, be are within a mile or two of the downtown station? Chief Meinzer said no, they get

3% into the main fire station, which gets about 60 some, the east end fire station gets about 20 and the west end by Toft's get about 15. Number 7 Station is the slowest station, but they have an elderly population and they're usually pretty serious ambulance calls when they do get them.

Mr. Kaman asked did he have any numbers on the Fire Boat? Jason and Rick (Reporters) he did not want to get rid of the Fire Boat, Police Boat yes, Fire boat, no. The Fire Boat he thinks we need. Chief Meinzer said the Fire Boat falls into different categories, but there are no wages or benefits tied to the Fire Boat. What they would do is, just like they lay out the ladder truck right now, is take an engine or if they need a ladder truck they would not take a fire engine and they would jump on a ladder truck. If they take a call, it comes up first, whatever comes in, they take those people when they have to check all these vehicles, boat and equipment and they just get on that vehicle or boat at that moment and go out and make the rescue or whatever it is. It's not that we staff it, it's not staffed. The costs are actually, the new Fire Boat has actually saved quite a bit out of our budget. Our old Fire Boat, the insurance was about \$7,000 a year and this Fire Boat the insurance is \$300 a year. Fuel costs are way down and its way more economical to run. And Troy (Vaccaro) is in the audience and he would put a transmission into that old Fire Boat or where that thing was \$5,000 or \$6,000 a year easy maintenance on the old Boat. They've eliminated the maintenance costs. So there is a significant savings for the Operating Budget with this new Boat. When this thing breaks down you think it's a lot of money, but the Operating Budget does not affect that, it actually saves money by buying this new Boat. And the funds that make the debt, that make payments on the boat come from the EMS Funds. Usually when they go out and they pick up people in a Jet Ski accident or a near drowning or they had some boat incidents last year, that's an ambulance transport fee. So that's a user tax that's taxed onto our visitors and boaters.

Mr. Kaman asked did he know how many times he actually went out on calls in the last year? Chief Meinzer said it was in the dozens he would think. They had some pretty significant calls last year. They had Roger Ragland with Outdoors T.V. Show who ran into the rock, they had some serious injuries and they had the boating accident, a number of kids hit the boat out here with one fatality and one was stuck in the hole of the boat they had to get out. There were serious fractures in that. And there were several drowning, the plane crash off Kelley's Island and they found the kid in the plane and his dad. So they get a lot of calls.

Chief Meinzer said the next one was Training, they had \$28,763. President Stahl said he didn't think anyone needed details on that. Chief Meinzer said Contractual Services was \$184,909. It was up from last year, but he could go through that. President Stahl asked did anybody need that? They were only on Page 2 and they were about 45 minutes into a 45 page document. Okay, Supplies and Materials. Chief Meinzer said \$186,281. Mr. Brown said if in 2008 we spent \$102,644 and we're jumping to \$186,281, what's driving that? Chief Meinzer said this is where they're talking Wages & Benefits, they transferred Uniform Allowances. Safety gear they try to buy 12 structural fire fighting pieces of gear a year for 12 firefighters and they try to replace them on a five year rotation. That's recommended state standards to keep them new. They get pretty worn out. They're a couple thousand, almost \$3,000 a piece. And also EMS supplies that they have to reimburse from Firelands Community Hospital, he could give them the exact number, but that has increased significantly. As their run volume goes up, they have to buy more EMS supplies, but those are big increases. He could go through all of the supplies by line item. Mr. Brown said it's just significant. Chief Meinzer said it's a transfer of; it used to be 51603 if you have some old budgets. Uniforms & Safety Equipment were both taken out of Wages & Benefits previous years. This is the first year it was placed in Supplies and that was for accounting purposes he guessed, but correct Mr. Widman? So that makes it look inflated.

Chief Meinzer said Major Expendables is \$49,539. They actually have a wish list from their officers of \$164,000. He hasn't prioritized them and there's some things they can't just get out of about doing this air filter replacement. That's another thing that they try to rotate instead of having a big ticket item that hits them all at once. Their air bottles are only good for a certain number of years and they have to replace them. So they replaced a certain percentage of them every year. Their dry suits are 23 years old and this comes in whether they wanted another boat, but this is not

really boat because they've had cars go off of docks and they've had children fall off of docks and they're things that they use. They have to purchase three of them and they are \$6,500 and that's why they try to use them for 20 years. The SPO2 Monitors are for the ambulances or the fire engines, because when the ambulances are out they'll get a second call from the Fire District. Like Mr. Waddington said, if they're downtown and they have an ambulance call, 65% of the time the ambulance will be downtown. So if the ambulance is out on a call, the only thing left is the fire engine. So they were trying to put some equipment on the fire engine so they can get there and take care of patients until they get another ambulance down from 3's or 7 (Fire Stations 3 or 7) to get down and transport and take care of patients. Back boards in there with straps; there's an extinguishing system for the boat that they keep putting down for the Halon System. The guys get in the boat and it does have a jet drive engine inside of it. They don't have time to wait five minutes to air the boat out. It's kind of like he was talking about with Chief Sams, something they have wanted for a long time and it always gets pushed to the back. And it would be in case the guys turned the key and there would be vapors in the engine and it would blow out and this would extinguish a fire, but they don't have time to sit there and vent it out. They got to get the boat started and leave and that's not the safest thing to do. The time clocks, they're going with the Time System and the time clocks are \$2,300 apiece. He's got to buy some of those. He believed they should be coming in shortly. He thinks that Warrenette said they lost the P.O. Station overhead doors are a big problem at their station. They've had to replace a couple overhead doors. There were way too many panels on one door and another door they replaced it. There's piston intake valves; there's equipment on fire trucks that go to heck because they get barnacles in them, because of water and minerals in the water and they corrode the aluminum filters are pretty expensive, \$1,700. They need to buy piston intake valves, are probably the most expensive thing, close to \$4,000 for Number 7 Fire Engine. There are ice commander suits and they are very old and they leak and our guys are being trained with them and they're pretty expensive and it's something that's not going to kill you getting into the water with holes in it, but it's pretty uncomfortable when cold water gets in your suit. So they've been putting silicon on them. And like he said, he's got \$164,000 of stuff, but what typically happens is stuff they've budgeted for already, it has already been put in the back, because their computer backup system just went out and they had to buy one for \$600. Their fax machine for their EMS Transport Reports at the hospital just went out and that was \$500. One of the guys hit the garage door with the bumper of the truck and that's going to cost a lot to fix it, but those are the type things that happen in a year where they have good intentions of spending the money for these things and they don't get done. Like last year they didn't buy all the safety gear and they budgeted for 12 sets of safety gear, but with that Battalion Chief she had been on sick time causing overtime. So they set their goals up and said this is their budget and they didn't hire a couple of employees and he said they could only buy 5 sets of safety gear this year, because they wanted to hit the target of their budget. So those are the things that they move around during the course of the year. That's the way he looks at it, this is a goal, this is what they start out with and try to hit; and if other things happen, they just got to make adjustments. Do they want to go through more major, he's got all kinds of stuff? President Stahl said he's done a good job personally keeping it close, he was at \$48,156 last year and \$49,539 this year. Chief Meinzer said yea and the previous year they were at \$71,000, so. President Stahl said any other comments on the Operating Budget.

Mr. Warner said his urgent. Chief Meinzer said urgent, he went through all of the urgents. He went through the time clocks and they moved that fire boat extinguisher up to urgent. Mr. Warner said good. Chief Meinzer said the SPO2 Monitors. He went through urgent things. There were other things in there that were pretty important also. Mr. Kaman said it's better to get urgent stuff that's directly related to the fire fighters' safety. Chief Meinzer said they tried to do that and patient care.

President Stahl said they were going to the Fire Pension. Chief Meinzer said the pension is up a little bit; it's up to \$844,441 because of the extra pay period. He thinks they're all... President Stahl interrupted and said he would tell them and he don't know if it is appropriate to discuss that extra pay period right now, but it probably is because they're discussing his budget and they should have discussed it on the Police Department. This Commission, speaking for himself, thinks if it falls where it falls, it's bad accounting policies to reduce that extra pay period. So he

would be receptive of a motion for the Commission to give guidance on that pay period right now. **Mr. Waddington said he's had this discussion with him, he would make that a motion that that pay period falls in 2009 instead of what they had discussed. Mr. Brown seconded the motion.** *Discussion* – Mr. Fuqua said he knows he will probably be the sole voter on this but; he would like to keep it in 2010. He knows it's just a temporary fix, but it's a fix. President Stahl said he respectfully thinks that he is overstating one and understating the other and you get to some place where you're robbing Peter to pay Paul. And let's get on with it, so that's just his opinion. Mr. Fuqua said they'll agree to disagree. President Stahl said they will agree to disagree and they'll walk out friends. Mr. Warner said they're going to have to pay that bill anyway and they said it will probably have to come out of our other money, the money that we keep every year anyway to keep for our bonds. We're all sitting up here understanding that that money can't stay there forever and we just can't afford it. So we might as well just take the money out and pay it and be done with it. President Stahl asked that the Clerk call the roll. **Thereupon the Clerk called the roll as follows: Yeas: Farrar, Stahl, Brown, Warner, Waddington, Kaman, 6. Nays: Fuqua, 1. President Stahl declared the motion carried.**

President Stahl said Chief he did his budget correctly. He was sorry to bring him into that issue Chief, but it had to be done. Chief Meinzer said they had to add \$25,000 for pension, because of the 27th pay period. Mr. Brown asked is that with the new firemen also. Chief Meinzer said when they bring in a new firefighter they make about \$15 an hour and plus benefits. Overall costs, and this would include everything, it would probably be around \$70,000 or so. President Stahl said that was about what he was always taught, with a lot of hidden costs with retirement and outfitting. Chief Meinzer said you're buying turnout gear, you're training them. Their base hourly rate is \$15.67 an hour, but they work a 51 hour week without overtime. That's 51 hours so they can cover 24/7 and then you get into the medical bonus that they talked about, longevity, education, the holiday pay when they have to work on the holidays, uniforms, which were moved. So that would lower it in a year, but it would be in supplies and still cost.

President Stahl said they would go to **Administrative Services/Human Resources, Page 3, 2009 Operating Budget.** Mrs. Parthemore is not here. Mr. Kline said he's got Warrenette's notes to go over. A slight pick up on the wage increase. President Stahl said 2% is the number. Mr. Kline said no, there was Longevity; Travel & Training has gone down. It's showing some membership fees to some Human Resource Management Council. There was \$2,500 in Employee Training and she shows Travel Expenses of \$1,250. Actually she's reduced all that; he's given them her prelim. It shows she's reduced all that from originally \$4,700 down to \$2,375. President Stahl said okay, he's not a rocket scientist, how do you go from \$2,002 (meant \$202,273) to \$153,000? Mr. Kline said she's just cut it to the bare bones. President Stahl said there has to be a major reason that Contractual Services would be \$50,000 less. What were we doing wrong in 2008 that we're doing right in 2009? Line Item 3, he was sorry to maybe get a little personal; either we did something wrong last year or doing it right this year or she made the typo, one or the other. Mr. Kline said she's cut out three positions in Horticultural Services, reduced supplies, and no seasonal in Recreation and the Boat Ramp would not be opening. So she reduced many of her services; and 50% of the budget was Water & Sewer and 50% General Services. Mr. Widman said it was legal expenses, some of the investigations and things she initially started on through her department. There were a number of charges for Downes & Hurst. President Stahl said yea, but she had proposed appropriations in '08 of \$52,000 and proposed appropriations this year of \$27,000, and the actual last year of \$76,000. Did she have all those legal deals in calendar year in '08's appropriations? And he thought the majority of those who were reimbursed by the insurance companies, so that will be a pass through. Mr. Widman said early work on some of these issues were not insurable. Contractual Services & Legal Expenses were \$65,000 alone. Mr. Kline said the biggest hit from last year was also the Mel Burns arbitration. President Stahl said she's not here, they don't really know. He would probably like her to be here on Monday night and he would like her to answer those questions via e-mail to them tomorrow if she was available to do that, fair enough? Mr. Kline said that's fine. She's on vacation. She left here this morning and she would be on vacation, so Tuesday. He could get a hold of her via e-

mail and ask her any questions. President Stahl said he's concerned about that number. Mr. Kline said which one? President Stahl said he was concerned about Item #3. Mr. Fuqua said Contractual Services. President Stahl said it was a major reduction and the actual '08 was almost \$52,000, the proposal was \$52,000 and the actual was \$76,000 and the proposed '09 was \$27,000. And he thought most of the legal costs paid should have been from the Legal Department, that being the major ones covered by insurance. Mr. Icsman said and he didn't know and that was her budget, but he would talk about the legal part of it. In Fire and Police especially they budget for arbitration costs and also costs of our representation. And that is a function of how many you may have and she's tried to analyze and presumed based on the past what actually happened as opposed to what she might have proposed what she would need. He understands the concern would be that you would low-ball something and then you would need more money, but you would have to come to them to get that. But it's incorrect to say that the Legal Department; they used to do it that way and he would take all of it and he would be here for two hours explaining. So the department that needs those services was going to have to budget for that, because he doesn't do the arbitration and they certainly aren't the arbitrators. That's somebody that we hire from outside on both counts. So it is a function of what may or may not happen in a particular year.

Mr. Warner said he was her liaison on this Commission and he's talked to her four or five now, she told him that there were some arbitrations last year. That would be it. We lost because we fired a person and we had to prove it and that stuff all cost. Like this coming year we got a lot of great employees out there, and the ones we were having trouble with were pretty much weeded out he wanted to say. The people that are there, we don't have any more troublemakers or anything, not to say that the other people were troublemakers and they may have had some problems. She said she didn't think we would have that much to do with that this year, there wouldn't be so many arbitrations and stuff. President Stahl said his only issue was that history, it may be a wonderful thought, but history shows that for the last three years it's \$86,000, \$52,000 and \$76,000. So history tells us that something's going to come up that we can't... Mr. Warner said we reduce employees. Mr. Icsman said he's right, he thinks it's better to have it and give it back, and Ed will make sure you give it back. As long as you don't frivolously spend it unnecessarily and you don't predict arbitrations, it makes perfect sense what he's saying, if you would have it and try to be close to what your actual experience was. President Stahl said he thinks it would be better off, you know history is going to say they can't get that crystal ball out. He knows where he's coming from. Mr. Warner said yea, but he don't see this was an issue. President Stahl said well, they'll disagree, that's okay, it's not a big issue. Bobby he would tell him what, could he do him a favor Mr. Warner and call her up on that? Mr. Warner said yep. President Stahl said and he did an excellent job of taking his job very seriously and he was sure he would follow up with all of them and pass that along and to their satisfaction.

President Stahl said **Purchasing**, someone said that's no longer there. President Stahl said **Info Technologies**, John Welch and Lenny Dixon and Tom Whitted. He always said the wonderful thing about that department is things run so smoothly most people don't know who everybody is down there and that is a compliment to his department.

President Stahl said let them bounce down to Cemetery. Mike Pisarsky, Horticultural Services, said Wages & Fringe Benefits, as they see they have dropped a \$100,000. They were not going to fill a full-time position. Also they will not have any seasonal employees there this year. So that's a major cut. Are there any questions? Okay, he would move on to Travel & Training was \$450; that was basically for association fees or Cemetery-type organizations. As far as Contractual Services, most of them would be for gas and electric for the house and Chapel and the maintenance building for \$18,000. And \$500 for trash removal and \$900 for phone service and there was also budgeted in for \$2,000 for purchasing graves back and there was money for background checks and drug screening. And for Major Supplies was only \$9,000 and that was the fuel and lubricant part of the cost for things you've got to buy like the grass seed, mulch, mower blades, rakes, gloves, shovels, repair parts for the water hydrant and things like that out there. So that's pretty much the budget. The overall budget was about \$72,000 less than last year. Any questions? President

Stahl said he gets paid out of the Hort (Horticultural Services) don't he? Mr. Pisarsky said yes he did.

Mr. Pisarsky said Horticultural Services they were down about a \$100,000 in Wage & Fringe Benefits, because they are not filling two open positions. And also there were a couple of seasonal people that would not be back this year and they were not hiring any seasonal people. Any questions? Travel & Training they went from \$3,400 to \$2,300. Again they have certain license fees and they have people that have state licenses, himself as a certified arborist there is a fee included that and there is very little travel and training. For example, this year he was doing a talk at the Isle Tree Care Conference and that's free for the City of Sandusky and himself. So they were trying to get creative and save the City money. So they cut that by a \$1,000. Any questions? President Stahl said all in the State of Ohio? Mr. Pisarsky said all in the State of Ohio. President Stahl said the Grass Conference was in West Virginia or something. Mr. Pisarsky said we've never done that, probably never will. Most of our associations and fees are for state licensing. Mr. Pisarsky said Contractual Services the reason that seems a little bit high is that they also pay for all the trash removal from the parks, which is \$31,000 this year with a three-year bid. He thinks it stays the same over the next three years, right Kathy? Kathy opened the bids. Mrs. McKillips said she thinks they will. Mr. Pisarsky said there will be a minimal increase in that. They also have a number of payments for the Greenhouse Improvements, that's about \$34,000 a year. They also pay the electric and the gas for the Greenhouse and the storage workshop building there, also the electricity for Washington Park is charged back to Horticultural Services. They did have, but they have cut out Port a Johns for the parks that don't have restrooms. Although Recreation will be picking up the ones for the places they have scheduled ball fields. Those are the major things, other than that they have \$800 for drug tests, \$500 for the copier, \$500 for super knife sharpening, it was very important to keep our chippers running so they can remove and clean up trees; \$500 for rental of miscellaneous equipment such as rock hounds and tie cutters if they need to. That's minimal. Heating and plumbing repairs throughout the year, that's \$500, and they also pay for repairs in the City restrooms like Jackson Street and Shoreline Park. Miscellaneous other repairs, weather repairs, vandalism repairs, they also take care of the problem repairs for the parks downtown, Washington Park, Mylander Fountain and Dauche Park. So there's a certain amount that they have to actually budget in for there. Also, he guessed that it has been removed from this year's, but they need to pay for the Yard Waste. So as they see, they are approximately \$170,000 less than what they were last year in expenditures. President Stahl asked were there any questions?

Mrs. Farrar said she was just concerned about he's not filling two full-time positions and he's not hiring any seasonal help this year? Mr. Pisarsky said correct. Mrs. Farrar said okay, how many staff does he have now? Mr. Pisarsky said they currently, including himself, have 12.

President Stahl asked was he going to cut Washington Park with a bush hog or how is he going to get it all done? Mr. Pisarsky said well, there are plans in the works; he's not at liberty to disclose all that right now. There's some things that are in the works he thinks that the Commission will be pleased with later on. He doesn't know Mr. Kline, if he wished to expound on that, but. Mr. Kline shook his head and President Stahl said no. Any further questions? All right Mr. Pisarsky, he don't enter into this at any other point, he was trying to look ahead and he don't think he does. He does a good job. Mr. Pisarsky said he don't think so. As there are no further comments, let's move on.

President Stahl asked did Mrs. Parthemore have any answers yet Matt? Mr. Kline said no, that was not her on his Blackberry.

President Stahl said **Municipal Buildings under General Services**, Mr. Kline. Mr. Scott Miller, General Services Director, said Wages & Fringes, it is what it is, it's nothing new. Travel & Training, for safety training they try to get the guys to do some specialty training for HVAC. They're getting a little more competent on doing that, which reduces our contractual services. The CDL reimbursements and things like that, he didn't know if they wanted the numbers to go with that. President Stahl said at this time, that's good. Mr. Miller said Contractual Services, like he said, they do try to do everything they can do on air handlers and furnaces and things like that.

But a lot of times they can fix it but sometimes they do have to call the contractor to come in and fix it, things like elevator inspections, fire alarm inspections, extinguisher inspections for the Service Center and City Hall. The Nextel Phones they have a few phones; drug screening; and then gas and electric for City Hall and the Service Center. And then the Honeywell Program is all included in that. Supplies & Materials are all things they buy to do their jobs like, heat filters, belts, electrical and plumbing supplies, nuts and bolts, door lock hardware, custodial supplies, first aid supplies, paint, flags for here, the Service Center and the Jackson Street Pier. He had it in there for Major Expenses, they have a stationary steam cleaner and pressure washer at the Service Center that was installed when the building was renovated or turned into the Service Center. It's about nine years old and it's probably at its useful life. He can't give them an amount of what they spend to fix it every year, but it seems like they're fixing it all the time. And that's used to wash basically all the whole fleet vehicles, except for Police and Fire. So that's about it in a nut shell. President Stahl asked did anybody have any questions for Scott?

Mrs. Farrar said she just noticed that Contractual Services and Supplies & Materials have went down and they're cutting from this list. She had no questions. President Stahl said and he congratulated him for throwing something in there for Major Expenses, that's a good idea. He also had the mechanics?

President Stahl said under **Mechanics**, before they start with Troy (Vaccaro) does anybody have any questions of Mr. Miller? As there were none, Mr. Scott Miller said again Wages & Fringes, nothing new. Travel & Training, these guys go to workshops and safety training... President Stahl said let's back up a second, Wages & Fringes went up \$171,000 to \$213,000. That basically, that was three things, Longevity, Bonus and the... Mr. Hank Solowiej said it was a philosophical change from the prior City Manager. President Stahl asked did he recall when Mr. Will was here? Mr. Solowiej said he wanted to have the actual cost of a department analyzed. During his time here, he wanted the Mechanics Division, their time, their overhead charged back to those departments that received the services. So he basically wanted them to be a Zero-Based Budget. What we're trying to do now is we're trying to get away from that account for whatever cost they do to any General Fund Department, it stays in the General Fund. So if Troy works on anything, police, Fire related, it stays here and it is not charged back to those departments; however, if they do work for the Street Department, Water Department, Sewer Department, it will go to those funds. So the increase, if it is kind of a guess, depending upon what else they may do with all the funds. So that was kind of what the transition is on that if you're looking at the bottom line, it's kind of a hard one to compare with last year. President Stahl said yea, he was just trying to figure out what it would cost if basically what it would be if you were buying it on the outside, what it would cost us to do it on the inside, correct? Mr. Widman said right. President Stahl said we were basically, it was just an accounting system based on what it would be costing us if we were right. Okay Travel & Training, irrelevant. Contractual Services maybe. Mr. Miller said things like shipping charges like when they have to ship stuff out. There are drug screens, phones; there's maintenance software these guys use and an annual maintenance fee to update that and keep it going. That's about it on that. Then Supplies & Materials is parts. Mr. Troy Vaccaro said he thinks they'll find there that that number is also high, because of how they charge back on half of the departments.

Mr. Warner asked how many mechanics do we actually have? Mr. Miller said we have four. Mr. Warner asked how many vehicles do we got in our fleet? Mr. Miller said we got 310 pieces of equipment, plus lawnmowers that are small, chain saws. Mr. Warner said and they work on all of them. Mr. Miller said yes. Mr. Warner said \$275,000 to take care of 300 pieces of equipment; it's not very expensive for everything that we got, four mechanics. President Stahl said that was very good, no reason, no worry, you guys did great. Any other questions?

Mr. Kaman said a while back they asked about you guys getting together and figuring a way to put out less salt on the streets to save money. After the salt truck goes by, three days later you got the white cloud of dust along the side of the streets, extra salt. He knows you guys can come up with something. He'd like them to work on that this coming year if they can and figure out a way somehow. He knows Mr. Kline says they're turned all the way down, but... Mr. Miller said they have a, out of their 2008 Supplies, they have a barn full yet (salt) and they have maybe 50 or 60 tons left on the stockpile that they haven't yet. So they've used a lot less at this

point, knock on wood that we don't get a lot of bad weather coming up here. They've taken some steps to start utilizing the salt brine similar to what the State does and that's actually bought us some time, saved us some time for having to call people in earlier for overtime. So they're using a lot less, they really are. After the fact it doesn't seem like that, because he knows what he means, the streets are salty white. Mr. Kaman said if there was any way the two of them could come up with a way of maybe even less on the streets and even still be effective to save us all the way around. Mr. Miller said they've been working on it all winter though. Mr. Kaman said thank you.

President Stahl said **Streets** was on Page 14. Let's take care of you right now so you can leave. And that's \$709 (\$709,557) to \$789 (\$781,269) probably \$25,000 of it is probably the wages and pay period, is that right? Mr. Miller said yep. Then Travel & Training stuff, they've been trying to get to a point to work with the State, they have an LTAP Program that is for things like properly learning how to crack seal and patching holes and work zone safety when they're out on the street. CDL reimbursements they already did that. Contractual Services, what they collect with our Street Sweeper gets hauled out to the landfill so there would be charges for the landfill. Outside contractors for milling and paving, and the \$1,000 leaf charge that we pay to haul leaves to Barnes. A couple of phones are in there and then part of the Honeywell lease payment comes out of there. Drug screening and that's about it on that.

Mrs. Farrar asked how many people worked for him in that department? Mr. Miller said Street Department has 10 or 8. The whole Traffic Division has 13, because they tend to the Street Department.

Mr. Waddington said and he would probably be better versed or Kathy the Engineer, a few years back we had that Toledo University Street Study done, where they graded our streets in the community. And as we all know, some of the streets deteriorate at a faster pace than what we had the study done. So would he have any ideas, is that something that he thinks we ought to rework? We have streets in our community that may have been graded good two years ago that are now worse than the bad ones that we had graded out. And he would like to go to the ground level with the guy that's out on 4 (Route 4) he guessed. Did he have any recommendations? Mr. Miller said with the way the budget's been, they're totally reactive, you know what goes on, but what they have to fix they go fix it. He don't know if they really have that capacity with the budget the way it is. They follow that (Toledo University Street Study) and try to use it like a model to follow. President Stahl said he and Mr. Waddington had several conversations on that study and he was trying to think of the right thing to say. He guessed with how the budget has been. Mr. Waddington said he knows it's about the budget, but it has an impact on what they're going to do in the future years.

Mr. Miller said Materials & Supplies fuel is big. Concrete and blacktop and stone, this year they used the beet juice. Well, they're kind of dabbling with it. It seems to be working out, but he don't think you should throw all your eggs in one basket. They're trying to use it the best way they can. Propane for the hot box mix and they're things like custodial supplies to pick up the dead animals and that type of things. President Stahl said the thing he thinks he personally looks at is 71 versus 92.5, so you've got a \$20,000 increase. Mr. Miller said that was the increase in salt. In 2008 they paid \$37 per ton and in 2009 it's \$69 a ton. It was \$2,300 for Major Expendables, they want to purchase like a building transit for a grade that checks the grades of your slopes. We get into a lot of stuff where they need to have things drained to catch basins and things like that. They're working and they need to know where to get it right. So that's what that's for. Mr. Brown asked how much is that equipment? Mr. Miller said \$2,300. Mr. Warner said it's important in their job on what they do. Like he said, he works with a lot of construction people out there and laborers use it all the time to level a lot of places and stuff. These guys are changing places and you got to know right where to set it. It's kind of like a wish list, it's kind of like you have to have it. Mr. Miller said he would go to Traffic. President Stahl said before he jumped ahead, they had some problems he wanted to address. They had a 2008 actual; they bumped it up from \$941 (\$941,634) to \$1,013 (\$1,013,817). Does anyone have questions?

President Stahl said being none, they would go to **Street Capital** and maybe he could enlighten them as to why they were at \$164 (\$164,122) and we went up to \$300,000? Mr. Widman said that should really be categorized as the License Fee for resurfacing costs. There's costs to buy equipment, but unfortunately we could do some things, we're trying to allocate three different \$5 License Fees. We've also had the resurfacing help that the overall funds were available in the Street Fund. As a stand-alone fund it cannot be in the deficit. President Stahl said Snow & Ice Removal he thinks he already asked that question, did anyone have questions on that? Traffic, Travel or Wages and...

Mr. Miller said for last year they kind of did a little house reorganization and moved an employee out of the Traffic Division, put him the Streets. He didn't know if they could see in the Streets Wages & Fringes, he was sorry the first question he asked about, he had to do a swap. Basically move the employee into Street from Traffic. President Stahl said reorganization right? Mr. Miller said yes. Travel & Training... President Stahl said it is what it is. Mr. Miller said Contractual Services, he got them some cell phones, drug screens, and they do a thing with Brohl & Appell and he can't recall exactly what it is right now anymore. It's for... Mr. Widman said SCADA. President Stahl said okay, they won't waste much more time on that. He tends to think he's probably okay. Supplies & Materials they buy things like sign poles here and there. Traffic, signal materials such as some of the hangers and the cabling around town is older and the guys are fixing it quite a bit of wiring for it. The streetscape lights downtown, bulbs, poles, traffic paint, fuel, safety equipment, and it's got some custodial supplies in there. That's all it is. President Stahl said any questions?

Mr. Kaman asked what was our policy now on replacing signs, not the normal street signs, but "No Parking" signs, your "Tow Away Zone" signs? A couple of years ago they went away from replacing them. Mr. Miller said they were still doing what they've always done according to how it is in the Journal (Traffic Journal).

President Stahl said Administrative Support, they already discussed that. The **Street Fund** is what it is. Mr. Miller said correct. President Stahl said Fringes & Wages is \$995,000 (2008 actual/\$995,871) versus \$1,018,000 (proposed 2009/\$1,018,182). At first blush you would think that that was a little under, but he thinks he must have had some staff reductions or reassignments in some duties, correct? Because if you went straight up on the three (3%), you'd be \$1,030,000. Mr. Solowiej said part of their time also gets charged to the State Highway Fund, which is on Page 15 for any of the work that they do on the state routes. President Stahl said what he thinks he's referring to though, is with the 2008 actual of \$995,871 as opposed to the 2009 proposed appropriation of \$1,018,182, if they did a straight 3% on that, that should be a higher number than \$1,018,000. It should be about \$1,030,000. Mrs. McKillips said they did lose a Traffic Engineer last year. They did move \$70,000 out of that account. President Stahl said okay, so they did do away with something. President Stahl asked did anybody else have any questions on Wages & Fringes, Travel & Training? Okay, Contractual Services Scott. Mr. Kline said this summary was just an admission to everything that he has gone over. President Stahl said yea, he was just wanted to make sure nobody had anything as they were following along. Did anybody have any issues?

President Stahl said the **State Highway** was on the next page of Wages & Fringes. Any other questions for Scott? Since there were none, Mr. Miller would get out of here before the break.

Mr. Widman said Page 5 **Administrative Support**, he wished there was not Administrative Support first of all. It's kind of the dumping ground, but they do try to use it he thinks anyway for a couple different areas. In some cases we try to use it to minimize the accounting funds to our cost of liability insurance until the General Fund gets here. If we were really into breaking things down, we could allocate so much to the Police Department, Fire Department. And he thinks we would have had some City Mangers that would have tried to push us that way had they stuck around long enough. At this point we don't see a reason to do a lot more accounting, because those don't affect the bottom line. So he could give them some of the larger ticket items, maybe for Contractual Services. President Stahl said fire away. Mr. Widman said they could use last year as a barometer, the BORMA Liability Insurance was almost \$332,000. There are some other bank fees, the state audit, the Sheriff will hit the General Fund, which is the one place the total cost of the audit does not

just affect the General Fund. So it will hit other Administrative Support. This was kind of an odd one, but we do have properties that they work with Kathy (McKillips) to get the exemptions filed, but it's a four to six page document to get exemptions. So it takes some time, there's a lot of smaller ones that we still have that we're still paying property taxes for. Those are generally just owned by the City and we use up about \$30,000 there in real estate taxes, but there are a lot of little parcels. We try to work from the biggest ones down as time permits them. This is the thing they work on when the weather is crappy and the technicians aren't outside. They have to do property descriptions and such and it's just that we own them. He mentioned audit fees. Last year between the Audit & Financial Report preparation it was almost \$45,000. Submerged Land Leases, there are a number of those that we have and we get someone else to pay. They may have heard how we used to get the other entity to pay it, so it didn't affect our expenses. You can't do that anymore. So we have to pay those. Last year we paid over \$65,000 in submerged land leases. We'll get reimbursed for those, but we're taking all that money back out. Things like postage is there. We have an investment advisor; we will charge that to this as well, as well as some of the other Administrative Accounts. They will run into one-time expenditures that a particular department will not budget for. We had a situation where we can force it into that department's budget and then have to amend it. A lot of times what we will do is throw it into Administrative Support, hope it doesn't reoccur, then end up having to fix Administrative Support at the end of the year. At times that will be Legal Expenses or other things that just are not expected to be there year after year after year. To follow that original comment, they've tried to minimize all the accounting entries and things that they may agree to pay a 100% of the time, but they will try to do that just to keep it simple. In a perfect world he would like to see nothing here. They do have down further the transfer, which again perfectly they wouldn't have to do that, but until we have a lot of operations, this will not stand on their own 100%, we subsidize them with the General Fund. The two largest ones are Police and Fire Pension. We have separate funds for those because we do have property taxes that come in, not very much, but they set those up in separate funds and then pay the access. Parks & Rec. is another one. Unfortunately General Obligation Debt is another area that we subsidize with the General Fund. The 101 in Other, those are income tax refunds. He could talk longer if they wanted him to. President Stahl said talk to him about Transfers. He figured that they would be going until midnight. Mr. Fuqua said no, they're not. President Stahl asked did anyone have any questions for Mr. Widman?

President Stahl said **Economic & Community Development**. They could just plan on having an executive session at the end of the meeting and Mr. Schell he would be the last one and then they would go to break. Mr. Schell said Carrie was going to kind of handle both of them. Mrs. Carrie Handy said Economic Development Wages & Fringes, that's basically Scott's (Schell) wages and fringes with no increase. Travel & Training is for him to attend different conferences throughout the year. Contractual Services at \$31,500; she believed \$10,000 of that goes to ECDEC. That's our membership for that. President Stahl asked had they changed that yet this year for that? He hadn't seen the letter. Mr. Kline said we have not been invoiced. President Stahl said normally, historically we've been invoiced for that by the end of the year or early in the calendar year, right? But we have not seen that invoice come through. So Mr. Kline you were the representative of ECDEC, make sure that they get us an invoice for that. Mr. Kline said yes, he would. Mrs. Handy said the rest of that is reserved for Miscellaneous Contractual Services related to survey work, title work, appraisals. Last year we had a significant amount of that and we're trying to estimate what we're going to need. We may not use all of that, but we did use \$35,000 last year for that type of service. And we may be able to reduce that. Supplies & Materials \$500, that's just miscellaneous office supplies. Scott could use some things for different presentations once in a while. Community Development Wages & Fringes was for herself, an Administrative Assistant, one full-time Code Enforcement Officer, and half of another Code Enforcement Officer. They are putting half of the Code Enforcement Officers' salary under the Community Development Block Grants budget to try to save some funds. Travel & Training was \$2,000 and this was for their membership for a couple of different organizations, including the Ohio Code Enforcement Officials Association and the American Planning Association. And that's for them to attend different conferences, and also for the Ohio Conference

Community Development membership, and then the rest is for them to attend different training throughout the year. The Contractual Services for Community Development, \$8,350 of that is their membership fees for Erie Regional Planning Commission. They have \$4,500 budgeted for notices in the newspapers. They publish a lot of notices in the newspaper for Planning Commission, Zoning Board and for various grants that they use throughout the year. They had \$1,000 for communication; \$1,000 for the recalibration of a noise meter and they would also have \$5,000 for a trainer to come and get some of our people recertified to actually enforce the noise ordinance. Right now we really do not have anybody certified to do that. It has been pushed off for a while so they would like to get that done again. They had \$4,000 budgeted for copies and they've just started looking at that in this last week to see where they can save money in their department. They were spending roughly \$2,000 to \$3,000 in copies to copy Eviction Packets, which is really the Court's forms. They have put those forms on line now so people can actually access those on line, but they would no longer be copying those so they can save themselves some money. They were copying about 300 packets a month; it was a lot of copies. President Stahl asked did they pay to click on that or is that, how do we pay for our copies for citizens? We have so many copies provided to them each month under our contract. In other words, knowing a little about the printing business, is it a reduction in the per click charge or did we negotiate so many? What he was saying is, if we have a half a million negotiated per month in totality, we should get a reduction with our copier company. Mr. Widman said no. President Stahl said he didn't think so. So they're not really going to show the amount of savings you'd think. Mrs. Handy said we pay for copies. Mr. Widman said departments get charged to the code system. You make a copy and you plug in a number and later they are charged. Discussion ensued. Mrs. Handy said they were also looking at not printing out, they were printing out all of the color photographs that they take of all of our Code Enforcement inspections, they have decided they're going to start saving a lot of those. They did buy a mass storage device that is networked to all of their computers and they are storing all of the pictures on there. Everybody has access to them so they're going to try to not print out as many pictures as well, but the color printouts did cost them quite a bit. The rest of that is a little over \$10,000 is reserved for Miscellaneous Contractual Services for their budget. They also have survey work, appraisal work, these are expenses, legal expenses. They are down significantly from '08, because they had a lot of expenses related to the Housing investigation, which was legal services. So they try to look at what they spend a year and kind of average it out from what they might do. They might not spend all of that, but they did want to put something in there. Supplies & Materials \$5,250 is fuel for the vehicles for Fuelman. A \$1,000 is for Miscellaneous Office Supplies; \$375 for a Polk Directory; \$200 for batteries for radios; \$150 for Miscellaneous recording fee charges; \$3,500 for fleet maintenance charge backs. They didn't have any Major Expenses budgeted so. President Stahl asked were there any questions of Mrs. Handy or Mr. Schell?

Mr. Kline said Mr. Stahl he has asked him about the ECDEC, catching up here if memory serves correctly, there are some personal changes going on in ECDEC and he believed they're not prepared right now to be billing. And he believed they were going to be coming to all of the entities... President Stahl interrupted and said for more money. Mr. Kline said to do a presentation yes. President Stahl said yea, the presentation to ask for more money. Our commitment to them was for \$10,000 this year. Mr. Kline said but there has been some changes within ECDEC and he was just informing him. They wouldn't be ready, he could call them, but they're not going to get a bill for \$10,000. President Stahl said he asked him a rhetorical question. He thinks he knew what the answer was for that one. Any questions for Mrs. Handy or Mr. Schell? If not, they would stand in recess for about ten minutes.

A recess was held for about 12 minutes and the Commission returned to the table at 7:12 p.m.

President Stahl said they would start with the City Manager on Page 7. Mr. Matt Kline said he did have an answer, but he would have to... Mr. Fuqua interrupted and said before he reports and Mr. Kline goes on, could he make a suggestion please? He means if they continue in this manner, they're going to be here until tomorrow. President Stahl said literally. Mr. Fuqua said and with all due respect to his fellow

Commissioners and the public, he means if they have any questions, he would rather individually go over the budget and if they have any questions, to e-mail the department heads and e-mail the Commission as a whole, because if they continue like this, they will be here all night. This is not what he expected when they set up the budget meetings. He thinks Mr. Kaman said it best, this is what they did when they first came on the Commission and then back then they decided that they weren't going to do it anymore, because of the time and redundancy involved in it. **So if his fellow Commissioners, with their permission, he would like to make a motion that they as he said, go over this, the public has access to the budget, so if they want to look at it and forward any questions, he would urge them to do so. Because they would be here all night. He'd like to make a motion to end this and review it, forward any questions to department heads and ask them to cc all of them on those questions and answers so they will have the same information. Mr. Kaman seconded. As there was no discussion, President Stahl asked for a vote on the motion. The Clerk called the roll: Yeas: Farrar, Stahl, Fuqua, Brown, Warner, Waddington, Kaman, 7. Nays: 0. President Stahl declared the motion passed.**

President Stahl said now Mr. Kline would it be helpful if they gave him, he thinks the number he was looking for is the carryover balance they're looking to carry to the end of the year and to back everything else in, was that correct? Mr. Kline said well, yes he means he would like to think the Commission's looking at the big picture and the big picture right here is the bottom line. We're at \$2.73 (million), projected carry. He feels confident that they can manage this thing, and they can manage this thing to get it where he would say we had a track history of making it better than what we've always projected. We're at \$2.73; he feels confident that we would be able to manage some things throughout the year. We're looking at some things throughout the year and we're looking at things that would have an impact on our expenses, such as street lighting that Mr. Kaman had mentioned. But he can't plug those in because we don't have hard facts. But he feels very confident that we would manage those things to be better than \$2.73, maybe \$2.8, he don't want to be quoted as to an exact price, but he knows it's going to be better than \$2.73. At least he feels very confident that it's going to be while he's the Manager. If they're not comfortable with saying \$2.73 or \$2.8 or \$2.9, what number do they want them to try to reach right now? Then give them a couple days and they'll come back with their recommendations, and they're going to be recommendations for cuts, and they're going to have to be probably personnel cuts. And he would like to talk to them about that in an executive session, because they're talking about people's lives and he would rather discuss that privately amongst all of the seven.

Mr. Warner said the \$2.7 carryover with the budget he gave them tonight... Mr. Kline said yes, \$2.7 and \$2.9. Mr. Warner said that's not \$900,000 that they're over budget. He's going to have \$2.7 with the budget year tonight, which is basically the same budget he gave them two weeks ago? Mr. Kline said yes. Mr. Warner said okay. President Stahl said that would be with expenses exceeding revenues by what number? Mr. Kline said \$961,000 worse case. President Stahl said worse case is a \$961,000 deficit budget. Mr. Kline said yes sir. Mr. Fuqua said this is not ideal, but... **President Stahl interrupted and said any of those potential cuts he believes should be talked about in executive session. Would anybody like to make a motion for an executive session? Mr. Warner said so moved. Mr. Fuqua seconded. The Clerk called the roll: Yeas: Farrar, Stahl, Fuqua, Brown, Warner, Waddington, Kaman, 7. Nays: 0. The motion passed.**

The Clerk questioned what was that executive session on personnel on actually? President Stahl said personnel. Mr. Icsman said the Auditor's going to catch us again. President Stahl said okay. He didn't follow the right procedure that Mr. Fuqua and he talked about yesterday. Mr. Icsman said it should be collective bargaining. **Mr. Fuqua said so they need to amend the motion. He'd like to call an executive session on Collective Bargaining. Mr. Warner seconded the motion. The Clerk called the roll: Yeas: Farrar, Stahl, Fuqua, Brown, Warner, Waddington, Kaman, 7. Nays: 0. The motion was declared passed.**

President Stahl said they had two ways of doing it, they either increase revenues or you cut expenses, one or the other. Did anybody want to talk about revenue increases? Mr. Kaman said on revenues, did he want them to e-mail those in with

their other questions or did they want to discuss them now? President Stahl said why not right now. **Mr. Widman said they did see the more popular issue the other night. Some type of an investment program for public services in lieu of cutting the City's public service. They need \$10 or \$5, some type of a monthly assessment.** He knows Mr. Icsman came up once before last year about doing street lighting and it's formally an assessment, but there's more to it than just saying we're going to put so much per month on the water and sewer bill. It was mentioned the other night that the City of Toledo does have a citywide program that they've done for years. Same bond counsel that works for Toledo works for us. So it's not like you're inventing a new mouse trap, it's something that you have to be comfortable obviously doing. If you wanted to target something like that through a certain dollar range, it's not free, but it's minimal. Mrs. Farrar said she'd have to agree with Mr. Widman, he was one of the most popular suggestions, definitely more popular than any increased tax.

Mr. Icsman said that is correct, there are a lot of rules about special assessments and some limited purposes for special assessments. And he thinks Toledo is the answer for us to investigate. We started down that road a few years ago he thinks, and it ended up that the Commission felt that residents, and again it's a form of doing something to the residents, he meant Mr. Waddington and some of the other Commissioners have said, no new taxes. So this is just another form of that, assessments and taxes, but you can do it. And they would want some time to make sure that they could present those rules and the parameters of what you can and can't do and what their (Commission) discretion is. But they do it, they do it in Toledo. President Stahl said he thinks it would be appropriate for him to prevent them before they further that discussion. Mr. Icsman said he thinks so, because it will probably get in there and cover some of the things, well he don't know what they think it covers, but street lighting, street sweeping and street cleaning, things like that are permissible. Some other limited things, but he doesn't know what that equates to in terms of the work you do to it to get to what. He would say what that would get them; that would be important for them to know too probably. President Stahl said it would be very important; that would be the crux of the whole issue. Mr. Fuqua asked would Monday be enough time for him to have that information at our next meeting or would he need more time to investigate it? Mr. Icsman said he would try, he thinks they could do it. He had some information from about four or five years ago, a bond from Toledo. They seem to be our closest neighbor that does a lot of that work. So they would want to investigate that. And like Ed said, the same bond counsel helps them is our bond counsel.

Mr. Warner said although that was the most popular item that they talked about the other night, he don't believe that he's totally comfortable just touching the citizens. He believed if they touched people, they got to touch business at the same time. He meant that it is a shared responsibility to pay for the services in this City and he believed that he would really like to take a look at the Parking Tax again. He meant that shares it over a couple of different entities, or if they just wanted to go with an admissions tax, you're talking about one entity and he don't think one entity is the answer. He thinks that hotels, motels, campgrounds, marinas, everybody that's got people parking overnight. He meant he goes out of town quite a bit and every place he goes costs him \$18 to 25 bucks a night to park and there's a lot of parking tax no matter where you go. He just don't want to lay that down. If we're going to touch the citizens, he thinks we need to touch other entities also.

Mr. Widman said he don't think assessments necessarily have to be just residents most of the time, but if you're looking at a type of a benefit per property or an equal benefit type assessments, Mr. Icsman is saying property owners, they may not need this information. Mr. Icsman said he thinks what Mr. Warner is saying is that he is talking someone who isn't a property owner versus somebody that is, whether it's business property or a personal property owner.

President Stahl asked did he think it was appropriate to bring that back on Monday when they know what those numbers are? Mr. Warner said he would think so. He would like for Mr. Widman to come back with like at fifty cents per vehicle a day and then a \$1, you know break it down a little bit. He don't know if anybody else has any ideas on revenue enhancement other than income tax or admissions tax. That's all he ever hears and he don't like either one of them either. President Stahl said they had a brief history with that Mr. Warner. Mr. Warner said very brief. He didn't

know. President Stahl said fair enough, if they bring that information Monday, they will discuss it then.

Mr. Kaman said two weeks ago they went through their laundry list per se, he brought up **leasing out the boat ramp instead of it being a free boat ramp**. He suggested leasing it out like we have in the past and the same with our concession stand in Shoreline Park, we can lease that out. He'd like staff to get back to him as far as what the plan is, why they're not going to do that or possible money that they made in the past with the boat ramp especially when they leased it out.

Mr. Kaman said he'd like **Housing staff to look at another thing he brought up was to help pay for when we tear these houses down, we could have an auction at them the day before they get tore down and sell a lot of the things to be reused in other people's houses**.

Mr. Kaman said he would like **Engineering to get back with him on the part he brought up about tarring and chipping our roads with no curbs and gutters**. It's not a popular thing, but it is from what he understands, he's not sure so Kathy can check on it, it's a cheaper way and it does last longer than just to redo a whole road and it can't be a road that has curbs and gutters. It's the streets that don't have curbs and gutters. Those are some of the things he'd like to have looked at. Mr. Kline said and Mr. Kaman he doesn't disagree with him. What he meant about managing the budget this year, it included all of those items that he has, he had the list right here, but to be able to give him a number that is going to affect the bottom line to the budget, would be near impossible right now to do. But those are items that they do for reducing our costs. Mr. Kaman said which could translate into savings or hiring one policeman or one fireman. Mr. Kline said right, but and the boat ramp was leased out in 2005. The City made, minus expenses the City made just over \$1,000 and they couldn't get anybody that was interested in doing it in 2006 and 2007. Mr. Kaman said there's a history there and someday they will sit down and talk about it, because people that did lease it out before that, were having the Pro Bass or whatever it was, but ESPN was here and helicopters filming it and things like that and they were having more and more tournaments and it was getting more and more popular. And then our past full-time City Manager for some reason did not want them to do it again and the boat ramp has gotten less and less every year since. Mr. Kline said it's no problem for them to try to lease it. Mrs. Michelle Hall said but the tournaments that he was speaking about, is that they don't see that they were having nine of them without a staffed boat ramp. Two issues, one with the boat tournaments, the thing in order to get a tournament of that type you actually fork out money and we don't see the direct revenue back in our pockets. It would help hotels and restaurants if we could keep them in the City. Sometimes that doesn't always happen like right now they go out to Perkins Township to stay and spend their money. But we're not going to see direct revenues from that. As a matter of fact she believed that large tournament costs about \$5,000, but she thinks maybe we paid for it. Those fishing tournaments have approached her to host these, because now obviously it's gone up now with hard economic times. They want more money from the City to bring these people in. So the City itself won't directly see revenues in that. In terms of leasing the boat ramp, it was actually 2006 was the last year and it was 2007 when it was bid out. We had one bid then after we sat down and talked to them about everything they were like no, we don't want to do it, which is why the City took it over. We could try again, but that's what's happened with the four years that she has been here. And with the Shoreline Park Concession Stand, they do lease that right now. It's the Bay Area Bike Rental location and they are actually, they're not seeing it in the budget necessarily, but they clean and stock the restrooms for us. So the City employees don't have to do that, which frees us City employees to do other projects. Mr. Kaman said good, he looked forward to talking about this boat ramp, because no direct budget increase for the City, is also the same with the Cruisin'. It's also the same with the Motorcycle Rally and the object is to get people to come to our City and see what a great place it is and maybe buy one of these condos from Mr. Krabill that have been sitting empty for several years. He meant it was a way to bring people in. It's one of our assets and we have to utilize it and the next thing we know is we're going to want to sell it. He'd rather utilize it, pump it up and put it back to what it could be. That's just his two cents worth and he would look forward to their thoughts. The Smith's, they were the last good people. President Stahl said yea, he used to go down there for lunch, shredded chicken

