

The President called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. after the Invocation, given by Dick Brady, and the Pledge of Allegiance.

The Clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington.

City staff present: Aaron Klein – Public Works Director, John Orzech – Police Chief, Rick Wilcox, Fire Chief, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Angela Byington – Planning Director, Nicole DeFreitas – Transit Administrator, Stuart Hamilton – IT Director, Don Rumbutis – IT, Hank Solowiej – Finance Director, Trevor Hayberger – Acting Law Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager and Kelly Kresser – Commission Clerk.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to approve the minutes of the October 9, 2018, meeting and suspend the formal reading. The President declared the motion passed.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Kim Eberhardt, 618 Sycamore Line, said two weeks ago when the commission approved contracts for the Jackson Street Pier and Shoreline Drive projects, the Shoreline Drive budget did not show a 30-year loan which adds over \$2 million to the cost of the project; nor did the Jackson Street Pier budget show a 20-year loan which adds over \$400,000 to the cost of the project. This seems to be a big jump and the projects will continue to rise. The city knew about fees and interest rates two weeks ago and everyone should have been aware of this when they voted for the projects.

Kathryn Carter, 5309 Columbus Avenue, said she agrees about the budgeting these projects and is glad to see Wes Poole did not vote for this because of shutting down Shoreline Drive. The reasons Eric Wobser has created for shutting down Shoreline Drive are non-existent and if there were a problem with children's safety, the play park would have been moved. The splash pad and playground area at Huron Park is closer to the street than this one as well as at Central Park. We are trying to figure out how to block this area off to get a 10' wide bicycle path which could be combined with the sidewalk legally and safely without problem. If there were problems with kids and safety, put up a fence instead of tearing up the street and twisting this area up.

PRESENTATION

Greg Voltz, Planner, thanked the staff from Designing Local and residents of the City of Sandusky for being so involved in drafting the Public Art & Placemaking Plan which will help guide difficult decisions the Public Arts & Culture Commission will have to make in a fiscally responsible way through policies and procedures which were procured from best practices found throughout the country. He believes this will help make the City of Sandusky a leader in the state when it comes to public art and be a valuable asset as we approach outside sources for grants and other funds. Designing Local's expertise in public art and planning is evident throughout this plan and introduced Amanda Golden and Josh Lapp from Designing Local to speak about the plan.

Josh Lapp, Designing Local, thanked Eric Wobser, Angela Byington, Greg Voltz, Talon Flohr and Kelly Kresser as well as members of the Public Arts & Culture Commission who helped get this plan out, get the public involved and ultimately adopted. The city had lots of great initiatives over the past few years and public art coming to the forefront is very important as it helps artists in the community and helps to bring art into the city while strengthening the community identity of Sandusky and is instrumental in helping economic development efforts. Public art and placemaking go together and many of the projects Sandusky is working on now and in the future and will help establish an identity for the community. Sandusky already has a lot of visitors and it is hoped to pull more into the rest of the community and make better places for those who live here. Several exciting and fun events took place including a Public Art Popsicle Pop Up in Washington Park where input was gathered from Sandusky residents about what art should look

like and how it should be done. We hosted stakeholder meetings and an online survey to gather public engagement to reach a very broad group of people. We asked specific questions to find out what people think makes Sandusky an interesting community, what makes it unique and why people live here to figure out how to enhance its identity rather than create a new one. They came away with some key themes including an interest in creating a sense of space and a sense of place in Sandusky and a desire to use public space to bring people together and create interesting places where public art can be used. There are many facets and this is a diverse community so we can help bring people together using art. Sandusky has a long history and a lot of engaged residents and can celebrate the spirit which exists in Sandusky. Art should be high-quality and interactive so children can touch and play with it not just look at it. Public art needs to be for everyone, not just tourists or local residents. The vision statement created is: *The vision of the Sandusky Public Art & Culture program is to enrich the lives of all Sandusky residents through honoring its history, celebrating its culture and creating rich experiences for residents and visitors through art and planning initiatives, public space and city infrastructure.* This statement encompasses everything this Plan is about.

Amanda Golden, Designing Local, said they heard a lot from the community and it is important to understand everything they heard was measured against what the national best practices are when it comes to public art and placemaking. The Plan has been divided into short, medium and long term goals.

Short term funding goals include:

- 1) Greg Voltz has been identified as the staff person who will act as a liaison with the Commission;
- 2) Public art program funds will be used to leverage additional funding for more grant money.

Short term process and policy goals include:

- 1) Adopt the responsibility and authority outlined in the Policy;
- 2) Adopt the Collection Management Policy;
- 3) Adopt the Donation Policy;
- 4) Adopt the Maintenance Policy;
- 5) Accept and implement the Mural Guidelines;
- 6) Accept and implement the Sandusky Public Arts & Culture Commission Communication Guide Policy;
- 7) Complete an inventory of all public art pieces in the Sandusky Public Art collection;
- 8) Develop the Public Art Work Plan which is an annual document that outlines what projects will be initiated in the coming fiscal year, as well as projects that will be in process during that fiscal year; and
- 9) Develop a process by which the Public Arts and Culture Commission celebrates the unveiling of a newly commissioned piece.

Medium term strategies for funding include examining the effectiveness of the admissions tax allocation and determining if a request for increase in allocation is needed. Medium term strategies for funding include:

- 1) Purchasing or commissioning of art through collaborations between arts and non-arts partners;
- 2) Collaboration with business associations, Lake Erie Shores & Islands and other stakeholders to increase awareness of the program and its purpose, engaging more residents and visitors in the program is integral to the future success of the program.

Medium term goals and strategies for art implementation include:

- 1) Development of a list of qualified artists;
- 2) Prioritize more expensive or difficult to implement projects and programming such as sculptures and public space creations that require a larger pool of dedicated funding.

Long term funding goals and strategies include the examination of funding mechanisms for larger public art installations.

Long term process and policy goals include:

- 1) Update the existing plan in three to five years to respond to opportunities and challenges as the program grows;
- 2) Collaborate with local, national and international museums, galleries and collections to do innovative exhibitions throughout Sandusky;
- 3) Create public art projects and programming with non-traditional partners;
- 4) Conduct yearly surveys.

Long term art implementation goals include:

- 1) Creation of partnerships with the local school system to ensure public art and educational opportunities for students and artists;
- 2) Prioritize more expensive or difficult to implement projects and programming such as monumental sculptural pieces and multi-piece installations.

Amanda Golden said a flow chart has been designed to show how public art will actually go from concept to implementation. Any purchase over \$10,000 will come to the City Commission as a check for the Public Art & Culture Commission to make sure specific projects are something the community finds of value.

Naomi Twine thanked everyone who took their time to put this Plan together which covers a multitude of different areas. This is a great document which can be used to plan out how we can do public art. There is value for public art in a community and this will be a great thing for the City of Sandusky and she is excited and looks forward to implementing this. Dick Brady said this process is designed to enhance our identity and not create a new one which is critically important. The most important point to be made regarding development of such a plan is it opens the door for state or federal money to enhance our art. Without this plan, we cannot get in the game and this, all by itself, justifies all of the hard work we have done. Wes Poole said the Plan is 108 pages and asked how it will impact private buildings if public money is involved; Amanda Golden said it will have no effect. Greg Lockhart asked if the city collection management reference refers to ownership or maintenance. Amanda Golden said when the city commissions a piece, it will own it and will adopt it into their collection and is why the maintenance and management policies are so important to guide the city through caring for the investment being made. Greg Lockhart said appropriateness is one of the contributing factors to the request for qualifications and asked for additional explanation. Amanda Golden said there are numerous ways to commission art and the preference is to put out an RFQ so there is not a strong burden on the artist. Artists will submit a resume with 12 – 15 images of their past work along with a letter of interest and three references. The selection panel will then work with three to five finalists who will be invited to submit a full proposal where some of the concepts will come to life. The concepts are paid for and the best practice is about ten percent of the value of the commission to create good faith between the artist and the community. Once this proposal process happens, the panel would select their finalist who will come before the commission to enter into contract. There may be some circumstances where “invitation only” proposals can be submitted for larger budgeted pieces. Greg Lockhart asked what one percent of the city’s admissions tax is if it is to be utilized for this purpose and said when we go through the work plan, this will need to be approved by the City Commission. Greg Lockhart said Sandusky was built on masonry by Masons and asked what has been incorporated in this Plan with regard to it. Greg Voltz said the biggest one was the conceptual idea to connect the triangle parks and highlighting this symbolism by an artist. Greg Lockhart asked if there were any particular structures or artistry as far as masonry goes and Greg Voltz said the plan is not meant to dictate what an artist designs. Greg Lockhart said it would be a good idea to have masonry as a major presence in artwork throughout the city as it was created by a mason and this is one of the only cities laid out with the masonic emblem and wants to make sure this is highlighted. The annual

conventions for the Masons have been held here twice. Dennis Murray asked for the particular section in this report which does pay homage to the Masons. Greg Voltz said there was a lot of discussion about masonic imagery throughout the planning process and the Arts & Culture Commission decided the best way to carry this forward was to highlight the triangle parks and present this history either through one large structure with multiple connections, via the triangle parks or parks with gateways heading into town. Nikki Lloyd said it is important to point out the work which has been done is to get this Plan in place and the conceptual ideas are yet to come. A focus on the masons is a decision which will come up in future meetings. Wes Poole asked why the members of the Public Arts & Culture Commission would not select artists as the plan calls for an Artist Selection Committee to be appointed for this purpose. Amanda Golden said the seats on the Public Arts & Culture Commission are staggered and the longest term is four years so there is a rotation. An Artist Selection Committee gives opportunity for others in the community to participate in selecting artists which is very important when creating a collection. A commission member will always sit on the Artist Selection panel to make sure the voice of the Arts Commission is represented. Wes Poole said this document is expansive and very much provides many of the things we need to move forward but the expanded community input is not in what is written. The members appointed have some knowledge of art and represent different areas of the community and would be able to give a quasi-professional opinion about what is good and/or what is bad and would like this changed in order to support this. This lays out a plan but if the plan has significant flaws which will impede the outcome, he cannot get onboard. These need to be tweaked to ensure this is not just another staff project. Dennis Murray thanked Amanda and Josh and the members of the Public Arts & Culture Commission who all put time into this Plan.

CURRENT BUSINESS

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.

CONSENT AGENDA

The President asked if anyone wished to remove any of the Consent Agenda items. Greg Lockhart asked for Item A to be moved to the Regular Agenda (New Item #1 below).

FIRST READING

B. Submitted by Stuart Hamilton, IT Manager

DISPOSAL OF COMPUTERS AND COMPUTER EQUIPMENT

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary impact. The items will be donated to the Goodwill Industries of Erie, Huron, Ottawa and Sandusky counties, Inc. at no cost to the City.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested that a resolution be passed authorizing the disposal of used computers and related equipment as being unnecessary and unfit for City use pursuant to Section 25 of the City Charter.

FIRST READING

C. Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

ANNUAL DISCHARGE FEE PAYMENT TO OHIO EPA FOR WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT

Budgetary Information: The total amount of \$15,550.00 will be paid with Sewer Funds and has been appropriated in the O & M Budget for 2018.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the Finance Director to make payment to the State of Ohio Environmental Protection Agency for the annual discharge fee for NPDES permit number 2PF00001 for the Waste Water Treatment Plant for the CY 2018.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to accept the Consent Agenda and declare all ordinances and/or resolutions as drafted and presented to the City Commission under the Consent Agenda shall take effect in full accordance with the Section reflected in the ordinances and/or resolutions whether it be in full accordance with

Section 13 or Section 14 of the City Charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the ordinances and resolutions: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinances and resolutions contained in the Consent Agenda passed in full accordance with the City Charter.

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Submitted by Nicole DeFreitas, Transit Administrator

AUTHORIZATION TO DISPOSE OF TEN SANDUSKY TRANSIT SYSTEM VEHICLES

Budgetary Information: Proceeds from the sale of the items will be placed into the Rural Transit Fund as non-transportation revenue, which will be matching funds for the Rural Transit Grant.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-198: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to dispose of ten (10) transit vehicles as having become unnecessary and unfit for city use pursuant to Section 25 of the City Charter; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said it seems like this is a lot of vehicles being moved at one point in time and asked for an explanation. Nicole DeFreitas said she cannot give a ton of background as eight of these vehicles were disposed of before she started. They all have met their useful life through the Ohio Department of Transportation but were left in the system for processing through the change of administrators. Eight of these vehicles have been at the city's Service Center and two were recently placed into disposal after receiving two new vehicles to replace them. Dennis Murray said he is glad Nicole is at the helm and said the transit system is terribly important to our community and this makes perfect sense in light of the change we have had.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

FIRST READING

ITEM #2 - Submitted by Greg Voltz, Planner

ADOPTION OF PUBLIC ART & PLACEMAKING MASTER PLAN

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary impact for the adoption of the Master Plan.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed approving and adopting the Public Art and Placemaking Master Plan for the City of Sandusky.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.

Discussion: Nikki Lloyd asked if it is possible for members of the Public Arts & Culture Commission to be placed on the Selection Committee or if this could be changed after supporting the legislation. Amanda Golden said the members will be selected by members of the Public Arts & Culture Commission and they could serve on both. This can be changed in the document to state the Public Arts & Culture Commission can appoint members to this Selection Committee. Wes Poole said he is trying to wrap his head around accepting the purpose of the people who are on the Commission not making these selections as he is not comfortable with this and wants this handled by people with expertise. This is like having a lawyer who someone does not listen to and this does not make any sense. He is not sure why these particular job descriptions were important which have little to do in deciding what is good or bad or is worth

having in Sandusky or not. Dennis Murray suggests an amendment at the next meeting when this is presented for second reading which would conform to these thoughts. Wes Poole said he recognizes functionally this is not controlled where it should be and is happy to vote this through at first reading. Eric Wobser said he has gone through at process before and this part of the Plan is to create a particular committee which includes members of the neighborhood who may have a passion for it and members of the Arts Commission and/or City Commission. This is more of a grass roots group who are directly impacted and will have more of a role in a democratic process. This recommendation would also go back to the Arts Commission and ultimately to the City Commission and the goal is to make this a more democratic and community-based process rather than less. We can clean up this language to make sure this local expertise as well as technical expertise plays a role in what happens in a specific neighborhood. Greg Lockhart said art is wonderful and he participates in art all the time and gets to as many art events as possible. His emphasis is on masonic history as a Mason and advises to understand this history, especially as we are the only city built on the masonic plat. This is a good start and he is glad we are getting together with artists and would like to have more of their input as they are the creators of what we will do here. Wes Poole said he agrees with the intentions Eric Wobser alluded to and suggests members of the Public Arts & Culture Commission are perfectly capable of doing this. He is not big on top-down driven things and mandating a structure which we think achieves some goals does not ensure they will reach out to particular stakeholders in an area.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

ITEM #3 - Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

LEVYING SPECIAL ASSESSMENTS FOR IMAGINE BAKING PROJECT

Budgetary Information: There are no budgetary impacts resulting from this ordinance, however, the City will receive special assessment payments made by the O'Donnell's to the County and will service as a pass-through agent and send the payments to the Toledo-Lucas County Port Authority to retire the loan.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-199: It is requested an ordinance be passed levying special assessments for the John and Adrienne O'Donnell, LLC Project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said this is important to residents in the Hancock Street corridor and this will increase the number of jobs in the community and is a terrific investment. Matt Lasko said this is the third and final piece of necessary legislation for energy special improvement district projects and the first two pieces were in front of the Commission in February. Now that the project is done, it is a \$362,000 investment into the facility mainly focused on energy-efficient upgrades, new roof installation and construction and all LED lighting throughout as well as new equipment. This legislation is an ordinance to levy which means they will pay down the mortgage to the Port Authority through assessments on their real estate as opposed to paying down a traditional mortgage loan through monthly payments. When payments are made, the funds will come to the city and we will immediately send them back to the Port Authority to pay down the loan. The O'Donnell's spend a lot of time in California, but have been a huge influence in the Hancock Street corridor and this is the second large project they have undertaken during his four years with the city. They made significant enhancements two years ago and we are excited for their commitment to the community and for the job creation component. Dennis Murray said he too appreciates this investment into our community which is turning out to be a

very successful project. The Energy Improvement District provides another way of financing additional investments.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #4 - Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

LOAN AGREEMENT WITH ERIE COUNTY LAND REUTILIZATION CORPORATION (ECLRC) FOR DEMOLITIONS

Budgetary Information: The city will be responsible for providing loan proceeds to ECLRC in an amount not to exceed \$125,000 from the Real Estate Development Fund. These funds can only be disbursed during calendar year 2018 and must be returned to the City in full no later than six (6) months from the effective date of the Demolition Loan Agreement.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-200: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and approving a Demolition Loan Agreement in the amount of \$125,000 to the Erie County Land Reutilization Corporation for the purposes of furthering blight elimination efforts within the city; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said the city had some money it needed to spend by a certain time and the State of Ohio indicated this needed to be spent sooner. In order to be able to maximize the demolition dollars available to the city, we are making this loan to the Erie County Land Reutilization Corporation so they can do these demolitions when the money is available. Once it is recovered, it will be used to repay our debt and this essentially is a bridge loan. Matt Lasko said in the past four years, the Land Bank has demolished about 40 properties in Sandusky saving us about \$750,000 as ninety percent of their activity is within the city. They are a \$100,000 per year entity and normally demolish houses two or three at a time which gives them the ability to pay contractors and wait for reimbursement. By the end of this calendar year, they must have to demolish 8 – 12 additional properties and they do not have enough cash in the bank to fund them. This would be a \$120,000, zero percent six month bridge loan essentially backed by the pledge of reimbursements from the Ohio Housing Finance Agency. We have also put a restriction on the loan so none may be spent outside of our municipal boundaries.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #5 - Submitted by Nicole DeFreitas, Transit Administrator

SERVING OUR SENIORS AGREEMENT FOR LEASING VEHICLES

Budgetary Information: There is no cost associated with this ordinance. It is intended to cooperatively plan for the future of transit services in Sandusky, Erie County political subdivisions and local agencies.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-201: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a Lease Agreement with Serving Our Seniors (SOS) for the purpose of leasing five (5) transit vehicles for use by the Sandusky Transit System; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #6 - Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

OWDA LOAN FOR JACKSON STREET PIER PROJECT

Budgetary Information: For the city-wide and wholesale rate studies recently finalized, it was anticipated that an OWDA loan would be obtained and paid as follows:

Planning	\$ 23,352.00
Construction & Design	\$ 992,707.00
Contingency (10%)	\$ 101,605.90
OWDA Administrative Fee (0.35%)	\$ 3,911.83
<u>Capitalized Interest (2.18%) \$69,489.91 x 20</u>	<u>\$ 268,221.37</u>
	\$1,389,798.10

The entire cost would be reimbursed over 20 years from the Sewer and Water Funds via a low interest loan. Final loan amount will be based on actual final costs.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing a Cooperative Agreement between the City of Sandusky and the Ohio Water Development Authority (OWDA) to finance the cost of planning, design, and construction for the Jackson Street Pier Rehabilitation Project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Wes Poole asked how this will be paid back. Dennis Murray said like all OWDA loans which the city takes out on a regular basis to fund sewer and water improvements, these are paid for by the rate users and, specifically, with sewer and water funds. Hank Solowiej said typically, the OWDA loans are paid down twice each year and generate revenues through fees during the year. Aaron Klein said projects such as the East End sewer project, Venice lift station, Farwell and Pier Track lift station projects have been done through OWDA loans and we ensure they fit within this budget. Dick Brady said there are some people who have raised concerns about how this is being paid for and asked Trevor Hayberger about the legality of assessing property owners for sewer and water. Trevor Hayberger said he has been in the public sector for about ten years and cannot recall a sewer and water project ever being assessed. Certain things such as sidewalks can be contentious, but not through sewer and water. Dick Brady said an improvement in a specific area on a sewer or water line may be a benefit to someone in another area of town and supported through investment in our infrastructure. Greg Lockhart said he received a lot of feedback about this project and said we are proceeding quite fast; the funding sources have raised a lot of yellow flags and thinks we should slow it down to make sure we are doing it the best way we can. He believes we should do it, but believes we are doing it a little too fast. Wes Poole said he will remain consistent about this project and the things he asked for to make this usable for more folks were reasonable and they have been ignored. Dennis Murray said a concern was raised about whether use of OWDA funding was stated previously and noted it was in the communication at the last commission meeting and with rare exception, we have always paid interest on notes and OWDA loans and certainly anticipated this. Dick Brady said if our Finance Director did not believe we had room in our financing to pay for this, he would be standing at the podium objecting to it. He believes we have plenty of room to pay for this and disagrees we are moving too quickly; we cannot move quickly enough to accomplish what we are trying to do here. Hank Solowiej said he plans on coming back shortly

to borrow for the TIF portion of this project and spoke about this at the last commission meeting and wants to make sure everyone understands this and does not want it to be a surprise.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray and Dave Waddington, 4. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. Abstain: Nikki Lloyd, 1. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray and Dave Waddington, 4. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. Abstain: Nikki Lloyd, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

**ITEM #7 - Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works
OWDA LOAN AGREEMENT FOR SHORELINE DRIVE PROJECT**

Budgetary Information: For the city-wide and wholesale rate studies recently finalized, it was anticipated that an OWDA loan would be obtained and paid as follows:

Planning	\$ 96,416.00
Construction & Design	\$4,192,661.00
Contingency (10%)	\$ 428,908.00
OWDA Administrative Fee (0.35%)	\$ 16,512.95
<u>Capitalized Interest (2.24%) \$217,587.51 x 30</u>	<u>\$1,793,128.35</u>
	\$6,527,626.30

The entire cost would be reimbursed over 30 years from the Sewer and Water Funds via a low interest loan. Final loan amount will be based on actual final costs.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing a Cooperative Agreement between the City of Sandusky and the Ohio Water Development Authority (OWDA) to finance the cost of planning, design, and construction for the Shoreline Drive Rehabilitation Project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Wes Poole said much to do has been made about this and notifying the public ahead of time the city is going to borrow this money and those are true statements. After last week’s legislation, we were told the price of this project from the sewer fund, water fund, sanitary and storm water fund was \$4,192,061 but he is looking at a request to borrow \$6,527,626.30 which is \$2.3 million more. The concept of buying a Ford Fusion and paying for a Corvette seems to be inappropriate and is at a loss for how we came up with this. Aaron Klein said the communication from the last commission meeting was to enter into agreement with the design/build team of Kokosing and the portion of the sewer/water and storm portion of this contract was \$4.192 million and was included in that particular ordinance. Now that we are going after the funding for the loan, OWDA always adds ten percent on top which is a cushion for them so they do not have to change their documentation in the future. They appropriate this money to allocate it for the project but we do not necessarily tap into it as we may get change orders or other things like it. The other items such as administrative fees and capitalized interest gets paid out over the 30 years and we will not know what these items are until we get the final cost of the contract and submit it to OWDA. Eric Wobser said the fees and interest at a rate of 2.24% is very affordable and ultimately when the net present value on this would allow saving dollars rather than cash financing this upfront over time by making payments and is similar to a home mortgage. While it is an additional cost, it also gives us the ability to spread this out over 30 years and once adjustment is made for what we would make from the cash we are not having to upfront plus interest, it ends up being a better or comparable deal if we had secured this loan through interesting financing. Wes Poole asked if there will be any more of these additional costs we do not know about on the rest of this project. Eric Wobser said he does not foresee any cost increases although there will be interest expenses on the TIF portion. When applying the cost of putting \$5 million into a project upfront or paying it down at two percent interest over thirty years, we will not pay out more, but in fact will probably save from having to take

money out-of-pocket immediately. Wes Poole asked what happened in the last two weeks we just discovered another \$2 million for the project as the point is he is uncomfortable getting one step and then having add-ons; he would be more comfortable had he simply been told on the front end what this was going to cost. If it was because there was no way to figure the OWDA administrative fees and capitalized interest because it was invented in the last two weeks he would understand but this practice, going forward, bothers him. He does not have control over this although this particular one seems justified, but the concept of telling him a little bit today and getting him to agree, and then adding some next time and saying he was told about this is a process he is uncomfortable with. Greg Lockhart said he is uncomfortable with the design/build process and would love to have this project done, but said we need to take a slight step back and have a second review of it.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 4. Nays: Greg Lockhart, 1. Abstain: Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, 2. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 4. Nays: Greg Lockhart, 1. Abstain: Dennis Murray and Nikki Lloyd, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

ITEM #8 - Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

PURCHASE OF BULK HIGHWAY DEICING ROCK SALT FOR CY 2019

Budgetary Information: Funds for the purchase of bulk rock salt are routinely included in the Division of Traffic's operating budget each year. The total allocation for 2019 is \$193,200.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-202: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to purchase bulk highway deicing rock salt for the Division of Traffic Services to be used in the CY 2019 from Morton Salt, Inc., of Chicago, Illinois; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dennis Murray wanted to highlight how much more the cost of this will be as the cost of salt has almost tripled and every city across the state is affected. Nikki Lloyd asked if this would be a good time to potentially talk about moving the salt piles. We are spending so much time and money with public art and beautifying the city, eliminating blight and cleaning up commercial properties and thinks if there is another location for them. Ironically, our coal docks should not be so beautiful, but this is where the sun sets so it looks great there but wonders if the salt piles could be relocated from this location. Dennis Murray said he understands Gradel is private property although the idea has merit. Eric Wobser said we do potentially have some land we could lease to Gradel for this purpose and would have to look at whether this is a fit for their business operation. Ultimately, this would have to be a mutual agreement between the two parties. He has not had direct conversation with them but we will be happy to engage them and see if there is an opportunity to find a more suitable location. This is private property although it is not zoned for this activity; it was grandfathered in by virtue of having this use exist here before the zoning occurred.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #9 - Submitted by Jane Cullen, Assistant City Engineer

APPLICATION FOR OHIO EPA LOAN FOR PIER TRACK PUMP STATION & FARWELL PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENTS

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary impact at this time for submitting the application.

RESOLUTION NO. 048-18R: It is requested a resolution be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to file an application with the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency for a loan through the Water Pollution Control Loan Fund program for the design and construction of the Pier Track Pump Station and Farwell Pump Station Improvements Project; and declaring that this Resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this resolution under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the resolution passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

- On October 25, Erie County is hosting an open house **public meeting from 5 p.m. to 7 p.m. at Castaway Bay to present existing conditions to seek input for the Cleveland Road study** to improve transportation between Sycamore Line and U.S. 250 and Rye Beach Road.
- **Two potential locations have been identified for the time capsule in the new City Hall.** Eric Wobser asked if the commission prefers the location to be in lobby or in the commission chambers. If flush mount is preferred, it would have to go in the chambers; if in the lobby, it would be full or partial protrusion from the wall and encased in millwork. Greg Lockhart said the lobby is probably most visible for the public. Wes Poole said he does not believe anything should be behind the commission table although the side wall or lobby area would be fine. Matt Lasko said we had asked for recommended options on where a time capsule could be constructed and they came back with five options - two of which were in the commission chambers. One was behind the commission seats and the other to the right of where the public sits as you walk into the chambers. They also provided three options for the lobby which would protrude from the wall but be encased. Dave Waddington said the lobby would be appropriate and hopes to get folks involved with this for a little bit of money, pictures or other momentous to place in it. Wes Poole asked if the lobby is big enough for this and to feel free to remove the vending machines as there are some long-term options that need to be discussed. For the money we are putting into this, the lobby area needs to be impressive when people walk in and cramming this into a spot they found is not doing it. This is a tight area. Matt Lasko said he can circulate a couple of options to the commission along with the floor plan. This would be an encased, approximately 18" x 2' box memorialized with some type of plaque and very visible. Dennis Murray said it would be a good idea to circulate this and it can be discussed at the next meeting.
- The IT Department will be working to issue a **RFP to replace our centralized copiers and provide service of the existing printer fleet** in the near future. The current leased centralized copiers are past their life expectancy and the current lease is coming to an end. A centralized and managed print solution is the best use of resources and provides the best print costs for the city.
- **Sgt. Dawn Allen was promoted to the rank of Lieutenant** on October 18, 2018. Lt. Allen served in the U.S. Army for 11 years and has been with the agency for 16 years and is the highest ranking female to rise through the ranks at SPD.
- **Officer Steve Ritterbach was promoted to the rank of Sergeant** on October 18. He served four years in the United States Marine Corps and has been with the agency for 11 years. He has prior law enforcement service of six years before joining the SPD.

- A conditional job offer has been extended to **Makayla Cook, who currently is a Reserve Officer, for full-time employment.** A tentative start date is November 1.
- **Fire Prevention Month** has been in full swing starting with safety talks and tours at the fire station for pre-school aged children as well as going into the school teaching fire safety.
- The Sandusky Fire Department has been busy installing smoke detectors in homes and Eric Wobser reminded citizens to be sure to test smoke detectors.
- The Sandusky Fire Department will be participating in trick-or-treat at Cedar Point on October 24.
- There will be a **re-dedication of Central Park and Grathwol Field** on Thursday, October 25 at 5:30 p.m.
- The **final phase of our software upgrade** for the utility billing program will be occurring this week and asked for patience during this transition. The online bill pay portal (Invoice Cloud) will be down starting tomorrow at midnight for about a week to accommodate this upgrade. Thank you to Heather Turner and Stuart Hamilton for their hard work and dedication with this project. If there are any questions, please contact the Customer Accounting Office at 419.627.5894.
- **Esteemed employee of the Streets Department, David Yingling, passed away on October 10.** A Sandusky native and veteran of the U.S. Marines, Dave started working for the city in 1999 and was embraced as a father figure and overall great person who was dedicated to working on behalf of the city and active in the community. The city is grateful for his years of service and a memorial in his honor is forthcoming.
- The Streets Division will begin **city-wide leaf collection** on November 10 and will distribute information through the [Sandusky Register](#) and social media. We ask that residents pay close attention to the dates and times to ensure they receive the best service possible. If residents cannot meet the schedule, there will be a drop-off area for bagged leaves near the Marquette Drive entrance to the City Service Center seven days a week from October 29 to January 4. For questions about the city's leaf collection program, contact the Department of Public Works at 419.627.5829.
- Various divisions have begun **routine winterization throughout the city**, including removal of drinking fountains, docks and buoys, draining of park fountains and closure of restrooms and other facilities. Next Monday, street crews will implement winter traffic patterns on the Milan Road overpass at the Butler Street ramp.
- The Water Department has successfully completed a three-year survey with the Ohio EPA and received zero violations and Eric Wobser thanked Orin McMonigle, Adam King and their staff for their continuous hard work to provide safe drinking water.
- Beginning in 2019, the Code Compliance Division will be rolling out a **“Landlord & Tenant Outreach Program.”** The intent of the program is to provide resources and information to both groups which will help each party understand their rights, while also sharing valuable resources to aid in property redevelopment and rental assistance. A total of eight workshops will be held on various topics such as landlord/tenant law, the eviction process, the rental escrow program, lead abatement, housing assistance grants and government-assisted housing. Guest speakers will be present for each workshop from such entities as the Civil Court, Erie Metropolitan Housing Authority, Erie County Health Department and the City of Sandusky. Informational fliers are available in the Civil Court, Code Compliance Division and Customer Accounting and will

soon be available on the city's website. Questions can be directed to Kelly Kromer in the Code Compliance Division at 419.627.5913.

- **The next Sandusky Neighborhood Initiative follow-up meeting for the South of Kilbourne District** is scheduled for November 1 at 6 p.m. in the first floor conference room.
- The regular **Planning Commission** meeting is scheduled for October 24 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room.
- The regular **Board of Zoning Appeals** meeting is scheduled for November 15 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room.
- A **Landmark Commission** meeting is scheduled for November 21 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room.
- Nikki Lloyd said at the last **Audit/Finance Committee meeting, the members expressed how proud they are of Hank Solowiej for receiving the State Auditor's Award.**

OLD BUSINESS

Dave Waddington said last Friday, he went to the City of Oberlin to see how they do their **recycling and refuse hauling**. The biggest thing he came away with was their hours of operation and wonders if we can have staff look into this. Their hours of operation are Monday from 12 p.m. to 4 p.m., Tuesday from 12 p.m. to 6 p.m. and Friday from 9 a.m. to 3 or 4 p.m. and a city ID is required to reduce the amount of recycling and garbage. If Sandusky can get a better handle on this our bins may not fill up as quickly to keep this viable. Dick Brady said ultimately, the solution lies somewhere in the future for us and we have to find some means to deal with recycling and is not convinced the drop-off stations we currently use are the most effective – it appears to be very costly. We are looking at every option there is but can assure we are going to narrow these options down and have a recommendation back to the commission prior to the April date when the cost and time runs out with our current provider. Wes Poole said what we are doing now is good but we have not done anything to manage the process at all. We set the dumpsters but the area is not properly signed to give people direction as to what should or should not be placed in the bins and part of the problem the hauler had with the additional junk placed here, he is picking up contaminated loads which had to be taken to the dump anyway. Before we do anything drastic, we need to come up with ideas as to how to manage it to properly ensure its use. He would like to see some enforcement and this is the place to start before we do something we know the community is not particularly interested in.

NEW BUSINESS

Greg Lockhart said he has been getting a number of complaints about the **commission meetings not being shown on cable television**. There are a lot of people in the community who count on viewing these and has suggested we go on Facebook or pre-record meetings. Stuart Hamilton said we have not missed airing a playback in months and this is the first time he has heard this. Kelly Kresser said the last commission meeting was held on a Tuesday which meant the meeting did not air on its regular night; it did air on the following Monday, as normal, and is the only one she was aware of. Stuart Hamilton said we have not missed airing a meeting since Buckeye Cablevision had some issues; they have fixed their equipment. Wes Poole said perhaps this is simply a customer relations issue and we can probably fix this by making an announcement when this happens.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted for the city to sponsor an ODNR grant with the Cedar Point Homeowners Association and ratify this through legislation at the next commission meeting.

Discussion: Dave Waddington said he was contacted by the President of the Cedar Point Homeowners Association, Al Peugeot. They would like to apply for an ODNR recreational grant to place ten no wake buoys on the lake side of Cedar Point Road to protect both swimmers and boaters. This is the same ODNR grant approved for the Harbour Marina in 2015 for the back Bay. There would not be a cost to the city for sponsoring this grant and the deadline is November 1. The Association will fill out the grant application. Greg Lockhart said we should have a review by the legal department prior to this. Trevor Hayberger said it is his understanding legislation would be presented for a vote at the next meeting and will have a chance to look at this prior.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Greg Lockhart, Naomi Twine, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 5. Abstain: Dick Brady and Dennis Murray, 2. The President declared the motion passed.

Wes Poole said the designs for the new City Hall are all tied to some basic concepts we have been following. Currently, it has been floated to place a reception desk at the front which requires a salary for a new hire and asked the staff to revisit this. This building is being designed with one way into one hallway leading to an elevator. On each floor, when exiting the elevator, there is only one way to go. A receptionist with benefits seems to be an unnecessary expense and we could do this through signage or an intercom. The bulk of business will come into the Water Department or the Building Office are located on the first floor as one walks in the door. Eric Wobser said this is something the administrative departments have been talking about and no decisions have been made as to how we would staff a front desk. We have looked at everything from utilizing existing staff at different times of the day to part-time staff without benefits or whether it does make sense to have a full-time position, but cannot speak to the reasoning the front desk was created. The user experience at the current City Hall is a challenge for a lot of our customers and he personally walks people up and down the hallway himself to get them to the appropriate department. The goal was to provide a better routing system both via phone or in person and create efficiency for staff and there are multiple ways to accomplish this. Through some type of central repository, we will be able to save a lot of people time including citizens and staff and we are looking at many ways to accomplish this in the most cost effective way. It is good to get this feedback and will take this into consideration with the budget.

Dave Waddington said he and Dick Brady will host a **Coffee With Commissioner session on Thursday, October 25 at 7 p.m. at City Hall.**

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Kathryn Carter, 5309 Columbus Avenue, said in September, 2017, the commission voted to let Alex Pesta move forward with plans as presented for the Jackson Street Pier. One year later, we have nothing to show for it; there was no presentation, it is only thirty percent complete and this was not even presented. Eric Wobser aggressively pushed to have the commission vote to go ahead with the plans because if it went into November, the amount would go up by \$100,000. There is no budget for this and we are close to \$10 million now and for once, the newspaper was right. It was also stated \$2 million was pledged and if this does not go through things would have to be eliminated or the city would have to ask the Department of Homeland Security for money. She did not know Donald Trump came down here and started putting in his ideas as this seems crazy. She is not sure what we are paying for as this was not presented at the last meeting. When festivals are held downtown, the city stated the pier would not be closed down but Shoreline Drive will be blocked off so one cannot get to the pier. Everyone will be able to get into the Murray & Murray parking lot and their marina and park to go into the Beer Barrel Saloon. Kathryn Carter said her opinion does not matter, but the bollards that will be at the end of the Jackson Street should be placed further east on the other side of the entrance to the Pier because Alex Pesta stated most of the Goodtime's customers come in by bus and they will not be able to get to his business if this is blocked off and this is not fair to him. The Masonic Temple should be involved in what would be a good honor for their contributions to the city and the country. There are millions of them and they would enjoy being part of the city. Kathryn Carter said at the last

meeting she complained about the Jackson Street Pier and it has since been cleaned up and thanked whoever did this. She does not understand why the state allows salt to be piled up so close to the water's edge because of runoff into the lake and would think this is a pollution problem. When Old Business is brought up, Kathryn Carter asked if questions which get asked at the end of each meeting could be answered at the following meeting. There was recently a television program about Boulder, Colorado's recycling program that works. Rather than having a person sitting in the lobby of the new City Hall, there should be a wayfinding sign for this.

Robin Hudnall, 124 Columbus Avenue, thanked the commission for showing support for the Public Art & Placemaking Plan. She and others will support changes regarding the artist selection committee as members have spent countless hours on the plan and this is the only revision they see to stay on the right track. The members of the Public Arts & Culture Commission were selected for a reason and they should do their jobs, as qualified, by providing input on who is placed on committees. The public's consideration will always be considered.

At 6:52 p.m., upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to adjourn. The President declared the motion passed.

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC
Commission Clerk

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.
President of the City Commission