

Dennis Murray called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. after the Invocation, given by Dick Brady, and the Pledge of Allegiance.

The Clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Dave Waddington, Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Greg Lockhart, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd.

City staff present: John Orzech – Police Chief, Rick Wilcox– Fire Chief, Jeff Keefe – Project Engineer, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Angela Byington – Planning Director, Stuart Hamilton – IT Manager, Don Rumbutis – IT, Brad Link – Public Services Director, Hank Solowiej – Finance Director, Trevor Hayberger - Assistant Law Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager and Kelly Kresser–Commission Clerk.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to approve the minutes of the September 25 meeting and suspend the formal reading. The President declared the motion passed.

Dennis Murray said Dave Waddington’s competitive exploits internationally are legend, as they should be, but he (Dennis) recently participated in the **Blue Streak 5K** and won a silver medal. This medal can be attributed to three things: 1) diligent preparation; 2) no bronze medal category and demographics working in his favor as only two men were in this age group; and 3) he turned in his time of 55 minutes. One other person participated who finished in about 40 minutes, but it is still **his** medal.

Naomi Twine said **Dave Waddington and Al Nickles were recently featured in the Serving Our Seniors magazine** because of their previous competitive weightlifting. They are still pretty fit and trim for their age and congratulated them.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None.

CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.

The President asked if anyone wished to remove any of the Consent Agenda Items; there were no requests to do so.

A. Submitted by Casey Sparks

ZONE MAP AMENDMENT

Budgetary Information: There is no impact to the general fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-189: It is requested an ordinance be passed amending the official zone map of the City of Sandusky to rezone four parcels from R2F (two-family residential district) to CS (commercial service district); and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the city charter.

B. Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

OPT-IN ENDORSEMENT AGREEMENT WITH CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY FOR GAS AGGREGATION PROGRAM

Budgetary Information: There is no direct cost to the city to approve this ordinance.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-190: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an endorsement agreement with Constellation NewEnergy – Gas Division, LLC for the city’s natural gas aggregation program; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

C. Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works**APPROVAL OF AMENDMENTS TO ERIE COUNTY SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DISTRICT PLAN UPDATE**

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary affect from this approval. However, solid waste related projects would be eligible for funding through the Community Grants program in the future.

RESOLUTION NO. 050-17R: It is requested a resolution be passed approving the amendments to the Erie County Solid Waste Management District Plan update; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to accept the Consent Agenda and declare all ordinances and/or resolutions as drafted and presented to the City Commission under the Consent Agenda shall take effect in full accordance with the Section reflected in the ordinances and/or resolutions, whether it be in full accordance with Section 13 or Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Dick Brady said representatives from Gundlach Sheet Metal are here this evening and they have been in Sandusky for over 100 years and it is wonderful they are choosing to expand within our city limits. It would be very easy for these kinds of contractors to seek wide open spaces which are easier to navigate and thanked them for their commitment to Sandusky and for having faith and trust in us. We welcome this expansion and hope for another one hundred years.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Greg Lockhart, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. Roll call on the ordinances and resolutions: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Greg Lockhart, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the ordinances and resolutions contained in the Consent Agenda passed in full accordance with the City Charter.

REGULAR AGENDA**1. Submitted by Stuart Hamilton, IT Manager****PURCHASE OF VIRTUAL SERVER FROM ULTRALEVEL, INC.**

Budgetary Information: The cost for this purchase will be \$52,890 and will be paid from the IT budget in the general fund in the amount of \$26,445, from the water fund in the amount of \$13,222.50 and from the sewer fund in the amount of \$13,222.50.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-191: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to purchase a virtual server with external storage and licensing from Ultralevel, Inc. of Southfield, Michigan, through the State of Ohio Department of Administrative Services, Cooperative Purchasing program; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Stuart Hamilton said this project has been a priority since he started with the city and much time has been spent investigating how this would best suit the city. The Dell product, through Ultralevel, will not allow for the possibility of losing our servers once in place. This will make the city flexible so we can adjust to things as they come up. A virtual environment is a single piece of hardware which lets multiple servers run. We will not have to purchase physical servers which would need replaced after three years and makes our return on investment a short period of time. The servers we have currently are more than three years of age and are all past their replacement period. If we were to replace each one of them, the cost would be \$10,000 to \$15,000 each so this new purchase has already been done. This is designed for disaster recovery and functionality for the city. Dennis Murray thanked Stuart Hamilton for all the work he does behind the scenes and said the commission has not been able to make investments in hardware

and software for quite some period of time and are now doing so on an improved and uninterrupted basis.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Greg Lockhart, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Greg Lockhart, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

- **Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$5 from an anonymous donor for the Police Department. The President declared the motion passed.**
- **Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept an in-kind donation from Rusty Zeller for the car wrap placed on the play car located at the new Lions Park play area. The President declared the motion passed.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said the play car is a replica of Police cruiser #8 which is dedicated to the memory of fallen officer Andy Dunn. Mr. Zeller also did the wrap on the cruiser.

The President declared the motion passed.

- Eric Wobser said **Dave Waddington was recently awarded for his years of service and for cleaning up the city by the Volunteer Center of Erie County** and was proud to see him get this award.
- The new **city phone system** is fully operational. The implementation went smoothly with zero downtime. Doing the design, build and implementation in-house saved the city in excess of \$25,000. A special thanks to Don Rumbutis for his tireless commitment to this project which freed Stuart Hamilton up to work on the design and configuration of the new system.
- The Police Department was notified of provisional approval and received final certification through the **Ohio Collaborative** for two of the three new state standard policies being incorporated. Community engagement, body-worn cameras and tele-communicator training are the three policies to be submitted and approved by March, 2018. These policies are in addition to the policies about use of force/deadly force, recruitment and hiring which were approved in March, 2017. Thanks to Lt. Dahlgren and Assistant Law Director Trevor Hayberger for their diligent work in this process.
- Members of the Police Department are **wearing pink badges for Breast Cancer Awareness month** during the month of October.
- The annual **Fire Fighter Silent Alarm parade** was held on October 8 kicking off Fire Prevention Month. The parade left the Erie County Fairgrounds and proceeded down Columbus Avenue to the Fire Fighter Memorial located in Washington Park.
- City personnel assisted with a **city-wide cleanup** on September 30 and Eric Wobser thanked everyone who helped with this.
- The city successfully **sold its \$2.9 million in various purpose notes** on September 20, 2017, to Jefferies & Company from New York, New York. The net interest cost was 1.135% and the notes will mature in October, 2018.

- The City of Sandusky **audit for CY2016** was released by the State Auditor’s Office on September 26 and can be downloaded from their website. Based on the clean audit, the city will once again qualify for the Auditor of State Award for CY2016. The Auditor of State Award is presented to local governments upon completion of a financial audit in compliance with numerous accounting and auditing requirements.
- The next scheduled **Audit/Finance Committee meeting** is October 20 at 7:45 a.m.
- The Street and Traffic Division has been hard at work with **seasonal milling & filling** projects on six smaller streets throughout the city including portions of Sycamore Line, Olds, Cable and North Depot Streets. This work is being funded by Issue 8 and the asphalt purchase was approved earlier this year. Once paving concludes, crews will transition to city-wide leaf pick-up in November. Further details on **leaf collection** will be released soon.
- **The Cleveland Water Alliance and Digital C will be bringing an event titled Internet of Water Challenge** to the region at the end of the month. The City of Sandusky has been working closely as a partner and more information will be available soon.
- Ryba Marine Construction will be performing **maintenance dredging in Sandusky Bay** on behalf of the Corps of Engineers between October 12 - 16, and lasting six to eight weeks. They will be docked along a slip just east of the coal docks at night.
- **Venice Heights Boulevard was paved** last week and it looks great. This is located within a school zone and slower speeds should be maintained.
- A ceremonial **rededication of Lions Park** will be held on October 24 at 5 p.m. The new parking lot and play equipment mark the sixth and seventh projects at the park over the past several years and more information will be available later this week.
- The **wayfinding project** is currently underway. Signs are currently being fabricated and foundations are being installed. This project will result in a city-wide comprehensive signage program to help tourists and locals navigate throughout the city more efficiently. Funding is through the MPO, the City of Sandusky, Lake Erie Shores & Islands and other unannounced sponsors and construction is scheduled to be completed by the end of the year.
- Initial project discussions for the **Venice Road/West Side walkability project** have been held regarding project costs, funding sources and alternatives. The total project will include water work, storm sewer work and bikeway and sidewalk/on-street bike striping on various sections along Venice Road from Fremont Avenue to Tiffin Avenue. Water and storm sewer work along the majority of Venice from Fremont to Edgewater and South in the Sagamore Street area will also occur. This project will be discussed during the West side neighborhood meeting taking place tomorrow evening.
- **The fit plan for the new justice center** is nearing completion and we are developing cost estimates for the two sites identified. Staff will develop a recommendation before the end of the year.
- The City of Sandusky intends to submit an amendment to its **FY2017 annual Action Plan** with the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development under the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program. It is anticipated the City Commission will consider this amendment during the course of its meeting on November 13.

Below are three separate amendments being proposed:

1. Eliminate the 2017 economic development Revolving Loan Fund activity. This project budget was \$50,000 and will go to zero. Funding for this activity is no longer needed for the current program year.
2. Increase the clearance and demolition activity from \$108,649.76 to \$148,649.76. The \$40,000 increase will come from the current economic development Revolving Loan Fund account.
3. Create a new activity titled public facilities. The new activity will have a budget of up to \$610,000 which will come from the current economic development Revolving Loan Fund and would be used for the engineering and construction plans for the Jackson Street Pier and other eligible projects.

The reasons for these amendments (to federal funding) include: the city cannot exceed 1.5 times its annual allocation; the Revolving Loan Fund (RLF) program was difficult to use and caused us to exceed this threshold; and Issue 8 Economic Development funds annually provide nearly as many resources for economic development as the total of the RLF. Therefore, staff made the recommendation to reprogram the Revolving Loan Fund for public facilities. Eric Wobser said Matt and other staff members who work with CDBG funds on a regular basis have worked hard to deploy RLF dollars during the past few years without success. Matt Lasko said in looking back over the past few years at our Issue 8 and RLF distributions, only three applications have been submitted and only one of these three projects have come to fruition. Conversely, under the Issue 8 program, we have distributed \$1.15 million. Between both programs, we assisted one business with RLF monies while we provided assistance to 59 businesses in the Issue 8 program with significant disparities specific to job creation. The RLF created or retained three jobs while the Issue 8 programs have created or retained 179 jobs. We are hearing about challenges which make the RLF program inefficient including the federal prevailing wages (20% to 30% increase to construction costs) and makes the low percentage rate offered an incentive not worth taking and more expensive. RLF projects also required fairly detailed payrolls to be developed by either the contractor or the person who takes out the loan which is a very detailed and cumbersome undertaking. Unfortunately, the city has also seen a significant default rate through the RLF which creates challenges. We have tried to be very responsive to folks in a timely manner, but projects involving RLF monies require an environmental review which typically takes an additional 60 to 90 days for approval from HUD. The times for negotiations also need to be taken into consideration for loan agreements, promissory notes, etc. while with Issue 8 funds, we are on a 30 – 45 day turnaround time. The outputs speak to the drastic differences between both of these funding sources. Our annual CDBG allocation is putting our normal CDBG allocation at risk because of these things and we believe it is important to make this recommendation ultimately to move funds from the RLF so they will not jeopardize our traditional annual allocation. Dennis Murray said we would be at risk of having to give some of these monies back and Matt Lasko said we have been asked if these funds can be used for other types of projects and we have learned they can, but with the distinction they still require an environmental review process. The construction and engineering drawings for the Jackson Street Pier are exempt from the environmental review process and therefore would not be jeopardized. Dick Brady said people who may potentially be the beneficiary of RLF monies would run from this opportunity because the reporting requirements are so burdensome and cumbersome. They may spend half of the money provided for reporting and this does not work in the private sector. Entire projects are subject to prevailing wages in addition to small business owners and their contractors having to go through a cumbersome and challenging paper process. Matt Lasko said the fact we have gotten almost \$1.2 million out the door through other programs, which have paralleled the last 20 years of the RLF, is a huge testament to the city being more user-friendly and responsive. We have also looked at the cost per job and in one instance where RLF monies were used, every job cost the city just under \$20,000. Through Issue 8 programs, these jobs have cost the city \$6,300. Wes Poole said he can see where the RLF may not be a good fit for small businesses due to the details

required, but prevailing wage is something communities all across the country manage to use while getting development, especially with construction projects when union laborers do fair work. Wes Poole said he does not have a problem shutting down the RLF, but the concept of prevailing wages preventing a business from being successful is easy to say but not so much proven as government should be trying to pay living wages for work. Additionally, Wes Poole said CDBG money exists for decent housing, suitable living environments, opportunities for low to moderate income persons and this is not the case with the Jackson Street Pier although he understands the federal government can give an exemption. If the city has \$610,000 it does not know what to do with, it is worth the effort to spend this to improve our neighborhoods and this amount would simply allow us to get even with our sidewalk program. The suggestion there is a 90 day period of time to wait to expend this money does not account for people who have been waiting for ten years to get their sidewalks repaired or their trees trimmed. Wes Poole said one of his objections to the Jackson Street Pier project was he thought money could be better spent in neighborhoods and getting people to move into our community and it was explained at the last meeting this was for TIF money; it is only 15 days later and it is now being proposed to switch this up and rob Peter to pay Paul. Wes Poole said the community accepted too little to be used in the neighborhoods and we have gone a step too far by using most of these monies toward larger projects by dipping into low income persons' money and placing it all downtown. Angela Byington said we would have to go through environmental review and the bid process to make repairs to sidewalks in our neighborhoods and Dennis Murray said we are investing in our neighborhoods, specifically through the neighborhood initiatives adopted. Greg Lockhart said he hopes we investigate other community programs and what might be out there. Wes Poole said the \$610,000 in this fund has been available for quite some time and bringing this up at the last minute is totally controlled by the commission and further, we have created our own emergency. Using this as a reason why the city cannot spend this money in other ways is a mistake.

- Marous Brothers Construction successfully submitted the final National Register District application for the **Columbus Avenue Commercial District expansion**. The proposed expanded district was considered and unanimously approved by the Ohio Historic Site Preservation Advisory Board at their regular September meeting with minor conditions. It is anticipated the National Park Service will provide final sign-off on the new district in the next 30 - 45 days and the district will be official by January 1, 2018.
- We are in active conversations with the respective parties in relation to various **development initiatives** including the Amusement Ales project, the Leaking Boot loan and the development of the former Keller site.
- The **new transit routes** are currently in effect and information about the new routes is available on the city website as well as in the buses.
- The **leased buses from Ottawa County Transportation Agency have arrived** and are on the road.
- There will be a **West side neighborhood meeting** on October 11 at 5 p.m. in the first floor conference room of the city building.
- The regular **Planning Commission meeting** will be held October 25 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room of the city building.
- The regular **Board of Zoning Appeals meeting** will be held October 19 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room of the city building.
- The **ADA/Fair Housing Board** meeting will be held October 23 at 1 p.m. in the first floor conference room.

- We partnered with **SMCC on Thursday for their annual service day**. Kids from Grades 7 through 12 participated in cleaning the downtown and waterfront in Sandusky. This was the third year in a row we have participated in the service day event and Eric Wobser thanked Brittany Sternberg, her staff and the students for helping to keep Sandusky clean.
- **Drive Thru Drop-off day** was a success thanks to all who participated in the event. A special thanks to all the city employees who helped, along with Commissioners Waddington, Murray and Brady, Sandusky Fire and Sandusky Police personnel. Eric Wobser also thanked our participating organizations: Barnes Nursery, Cyclone Services, Sandusky Steel, Goodwill and Interstate Batteries. This event grows each year and we look forward to the Spring, 2018 event.
- **Requests for Proposals to operate the Shelby Street Boat Ramp in 2018** will be available October 12 in the City Manager's Office and on the city website. Proposals must be submitted by November 9 at 3 p.m.
- **Trick or Treat** in the City of Sandusky will include:
 1. Downtown merchant Trick or Treat on October 28 from 11 a.m. to 1 p.m.;
 2. City-wide Trick or Treat on October 31 from 5 p.m. to 7:30 p.m.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

NEW BUSINESS

Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to appoint Naomi Twine to the Administrative Benefit Review Committee. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Wes Poole and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to change the time of the next commission meeting (October 23) to 5:30 p.m.

Discussion: Wes Poole said this will allow the commissioners to participate in the SCS ground-breaking ceremony.

The President declared the motion passed.

Greg Lockhart thanked everyone who attended the **Fire Fighter and first responder event** at the Fire Fighters memorial on Sunday and said attendance was much larger than last year.

Dennis Murray wished the **Blue Streaks good luck** this Friday as they and Clyde are both undefeated and it will be an exciting game.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Kathryn Carter, 5309 Columbus Avenue, said it was recently stated parking will be lost on the Jackson Street Pier if it were changed to be diagonal parking and the proposed 90 degree parking is more efficient. The solution is the walkway at the North end. Bicycles and walkers can use the same walkway if it is 10' and it could be made 10' south of the flagpoles rather than 20'. Vehicles do not overhang the sidewalks and the curb is high enough to prevent this so planter seats are not necessary to create a barrier. This would leave 10', and parking can be diagonal without losing parking. This was proven in Cleveland's Public Square as planters get used for trash cans and 10' garden benches are more comfortable and easier to maintain while flattop benches do not seem comfortable. On the southwest end of the Pier, the security fence is 40' from the restroom building but the new design shows 20' from the building. It was stated after conversation with some government entity the city could put parking this close to the walkways and the security area, but the city should want this in writing before the design is completed. As for the selfie-spot, Kathryn Carter proposed a selfie-tour starting at the postcard on the back wall of the State Theatre, the floral clock, the Boy With the Boot, the Carousel Museum, the paver at the Jackson

Street Pier, Schade-Mylander Plaza, the Freedom Shrine, Shoreline Park and Toft Dairy. This could be done through an App, the city and Shores & Islands website and would be more interesting for people.

Bonnie Grove, 434 Perry Street, said it was stated there are 37 or 39 streets slated for repair in 2018 and asked where the list of these streets can be found. Dennis Murray said this is available in the city's capital plan and is also on the city's website. Jeff Keefe said the general plan has a list of the major streets and if additional funding becomes available, this list can be expanded or others can be added.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said there was an article about Ability Works selling their building for relocation purposes and the city provided RLF monies to them; what will happen to this loan. Matt Lasko said this loan is collateralized by a mortgage on the property and would have to be paid in full at the time the property transfers; the amount owed cannot be reduced unless the commission were to approve it. Eric Wobser said to his knowledge, the city has not been approached about this and there is not an expectation the city would not be paid in full if this transaction takes place. Dick Brady said it is not incumbent upon Ability Works to communicate a potential sale to the city; when the sale closes, the bank – or the title company - has a fiscal responsibility to pay the city. Sharon Johnson said the RLF is obsolete with Issue 8 grants as they are free and without obligation or restriction. It looks as if the RLF is going to be set up like the EMS fund but now that it has reached \$400,000, we can bleed off the rest of the money; Dennis Murray said there has not been a proposal to do this and when the money is back in the RLF, it will be up to the city how to utilize it. Sharon Johnson said the TIF money was supposed to take care of the Jackson Street Pier expenses and the design is not coming from this. The City Hall developer received TIF money for their development and now the commission is raiding the RLF. The Jackson Street Pier is not an area for low- to moderate- income persons and the CDBG funding should be looked at; Dennis Murray said the Pier is open for all to use and disagrees with this representation.

Arlene Thompson, 1902 Adrian Circle, said the Pier is open to all city residents, but it may be the city is trying to make this an attraction for tour buses for the boat lines. There is no better way for city leaders to use city money than to make it safe for the children of this community. It did not take long to use the grant which became available for removing sidewalks being buckled by the trees and Adrian Circle has five red maple trees where it used to be lined with them. Residents were told if the trees were not removed, the sidewalks would not have been fixed for free and this street has been raped. The cul-de-sac was tarred and stoned and the residents do not like it. Kids walk through the snow to catch a bus at the end of the street and although they are not low income, these kids count and this money should not be used toward the Pier. If the commission truly wants to use these funds for the betterment of the city, kids should be treated kindly. They also fought a golf course being built behind their homes and having insidious weeds removed. Cedar Point now owns this property and they and Firelands Regional Medical Center are the only big employers we have to worry about. The Pier is the last place citizens of Sandusky can go to watch Cedar Point and appreciates them bringing money into the city, but does not appreciate how the city is spending it.

At 5:58 p.m., upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to adjourn. The President declared the motion passed.

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC
Commission Clerk

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.
President of the City Commission